

Reviews & Opinions

ON
Works by

BIMALA CHURN LAW, Ph D., M A., B L

*Calcutta University Gold Medalist, Sir Asutosh Mookerjee Gold
Medalist Griffith Prizeman Calcutta University, Honorary*

Correspondent Archæological Survey of India

Advocate High Court Calcutta Corporate

Member American Oriental

Society, etc etc

Young Men of India September 1924 —Dr B C Law's services to the cause of Indian culture are not only important, but valuable for a number of reasons. His excellent researches into Buddhist history, including its social and political conditions as well as much biographical material, have thrown a flood of light on that field of Indology and brought together data and evidences that will certainly do inestimable good to later workers and scholars. He has been at many places quite original, and his consistent industry in collecting all types of matter from various sources is worthy of the highest praise. It is gratifying to note that sound scholars of his stamp, who are not technically members of the Education Department, are taking up researching and writing on their own account for the love of their literature, nation and country.

SOME KSATRIYA TRIBES OF ANCIENT INDIA

Contents The Licchavis — The Jats — The Viddhas — The Mallas — The
 Silyas — The Bhis — The Koliyas — The Moriyas — The Bhaggas —
 The Kallimias — The Madias — The Kambojas — The Gandhāras

Dr A V Williams Jackson — * * * valuable work * * *

I know its worth because I know your previous publications on Indian subjects that are of keen interest to me. As I turn the pages, from Licchavis onward, I see how much is in store for one who is a student of the History of India, upon which I have long lectured at Columbia University * * * Such researches as indicated by this, and your previous work, are sure to prove an asset to scholarship.

Mr F E Pargiter — * * * I have been through the volume just sent. It shows great research, and you have brought together a large quantity of material concerning the peoples mentioned in it. With much of that I am in accord.

Dr E J Thomas — * * * It is extremely interesting * * * richness of the contents. These have not been recorded in English before, and I am sure that it is necessary to study the legends as we find them before we can begin to form a picture of the history. Even a purely imaginative legend may give us important items of facts.

Dr Sten Konow — It is a very useful work you have undertaken to put together all the references available from literature about the Ksatriya clans. I wish that we had more books of the same kind, not only about tribes and clans but also about geographical designations. The great merit of such books is that they allow you to judge for yourself without simply accepting the opinion of the author. I am very thankful to you for your careful piecing together of such evidence.

as is available and I look forward to further important contributions from you in elucidation of ancient Indian history.

Mrs C. A. F. Rhys Davids: Thank you much for the gift of your very readable and clear-written work. You give us many aperçus of what seems to have been a simple folk of a crude stage of civilisation, when we get light upon them. Your book is a more ample and detailed monograph than what I had expected.

Dr. A. Berriedale Keith writes in his foreword to the above book: The most pressing need at the present day is a detailed investigation of carefully chosen aspects of Indian history, and it was a happy thought of Dr. Bimala Charan Law to select for investigation the history of certain Ksatriya clans of ancient India. Careful collections of facts such as are contained in this work form the only sound basis of further research and the future historian of India will find his task substantially furthered both by the wide knowledge and by the sound judgment of the author. Many things are obscure in the history of these clans and it is of special value to have the whole of the facts regarding them set out without *parti pris* in a spirit of scientific research.

Dr F O Schrader:—There is so much interesting material in it and your way of dealing with it is attractive throughout.

Dr E W Hopkins: I was much pleased with your volume on Ksatriya tribes of Ancient India, which I have read with much historical profit. Please accept my thanks for the very useful work.

Dr Jarl Charpentier: Your valuable book on Ksatriya Tribes in Ancient India. I have found it a very valuable contribution to the history of ancient India. The subject has not, to my knowledge, been dealt with properly in any previous work, and I am astonished at the vast and, as far as I can judge, exhaustive collection of materials that you have succeeded in

bringing together I shall certainly recommend the book to those of my students who are concerned with similar topics

Dr W Geiger —Valuable present * * * It was a happy idea, I think, to collect all the notices to be found in Indian sources about the Ksatriya clans in India in the Buddhist period. For this is of special importance for our knowledge of Indian life during those centuries. You have splendidly enlarged and supplied the materials shortly dealt with by Prof Rhys Davids in his well known book on Buddhist India. I see with special interest that you have utilised for your work the *Mahāvamsa Tika*.

Dr L D Barnett —The additions that you have made, increase the usefulness of the work.

Sir Charles Eliot —In looking through the Ksatriya tribes, I found the chapters on the Licchavis and Salyas particularly interesting and I am confident that the book will prove of real value to students.

Dr Louis de la Vallée Poussin — * * * Unfortunately your book on Ksatriyas comes when I am dispatching the last proofs of a *Historie de l'Inde*, and I can only add in a footnote that I have not been able to draw from it a number of details and observations worthy of notice. But when I shall come to the Guptas, your remarks on the Licchavis will be discussed.

J R A S April 1925 — * * * *the writer has claims to be regarded as a sound scholar and that the work has been written in a spirit of scientific research.* The writer previously published a book on Ksatriya clans in Buddhist India which gained a favourable reception and the present work is an amplification of the earlier one, with four chapters of entirely new matter, the object of the whole being to present a narrative of the history, manners and customs of the chief Ksatriya tribes in ancient times. It contains nine chapters dealing

with the Licchavis, Jnatikas, Videhas, Mallas, Sakyas, Bulis, Madras, Kambojas, and Gandharas. The author's conclusions are mainly based on literary tradition as embodied in Sanskrit, Pali and Prakrit works, but he has also made use of coins and inscriptions. The general result of the enquiry is to discourage any over-estimation of the primitive Aiyas and to indicate that they brought with them to India, as it is clear they also brought into Iran, practices and habits similar and in no way superior to those of other nomadic tribes.

Le Museon (T.xxxvii), Brussels: Criticism has laid a very favourable welcome to a work of the same author. One will find the second edition, corrected and enlarged of the first sketch. While running through the Index one sees that Dr B C Law does not ignore anything which interests his subject. To speak the truth, we find here either the exposition or the resume of all the historical or legendary sources. Very little of useless words. References are numerous, precise and of most varied order. The chapter on the Sakyas, for example, uses Pali, Sanskrit and Chinese sources. I am very glad to associate myself with the high praises which Dr A B Keith accords to the author. (Reviewed by Dr Louis de la Vallee Poussin)

The Times Literary Supplement: In his search for material for the history of Ksatriya clans in early India Dr Law has, one would think, very nearly exhausted all the available records. He claims to have studied not only the European and Indian scholars who have made researches, but also to have ransacked an immense quantity of Hindu and Buddhist literature. To collect every possible reference to a particular tribe or to any individual of eminence belonging to that tribe is undoubtedly useful. Dr Law has, however, succeeded in showing that many of these ancient clans were exceedingly prosperous, and that they were for the most part a cultivated and a manly race. The section on the

Licchavis, which occupies more than a third of the book, is very well done, and Dr Law claims, no doubt rightly, that he has added much to the information already available, especially as regards matrimonial practices and the condition of Varanasi, the capital city. The description of Gandhara is particularly interesting to European scholars because of its connexion with Alexander and because archaeological research has enabled us to supplement literary remains.

Bulletin de l'Ecole Française d'Extrême Orient (tome xxv) —

Mr Law has applied with equal success the same method upon the historical field in his work on the Kātrivā clans of Ancient India. It is proposed at the beginning to trace as completely as possible, the manners and customs of the clans. For this he is not confined this time to the limits of the Buddhistic canon but he has made references outside the Tripitaka, to all the sources of information. Vedic Epic poems Puranic Jātaka works, inscriptions, etc. Utilising judiciously the scattered evidences of these different categories of texts he has attempted to give a picture relatively precise of the tribes who appear sporadically in the literature, Licchavis, Jāttilas, Vidharas, Mallas, Sakas, Bhis, Koliyas, Moriyas Bhaggas, Kāshyapas, Madras, Kambojas, Gandharas. This collection of facts is an excellent contribution to the ancient history of India.

II

ANCIENT MID-INDIAN KSATRIYA TRIBES, Vol I.

Contents The *Kurus* — The *Pancālas* — The *Matsyas* — The *Sūrasenas* — The
Cedis — The *Vasas* or The *Vamsas* or *Valsas* — The *Atantis* — The
Usmaras

Dr Sylvain Levi: 'valuable book' 'your book as it stands, is an useful compilation of data drawn from all sources' 'I'

Dr Rhys Davids. ' ' ' There is so much historical digging to be done and you are certainly doing your full share

Dr A Berriedale Keith. This volume forms a very useful addition to the information which you have already made available regarding other of the tribes of India. It is most convenient to have so much information carefully collected and made accessible especially as the work is done not in the interest of any preconceived theory but simply to elicit information.

Mr F E Pargiter. I am glad to see the result of your studies in that subject.

Dr F Otto Schrader : ' ' ' both attractive and useful. It will be appreciated as a book of reference by all who are interested in Indian historical research. ' '

Prof E J Rapson ' ' ' It is evidently a very useful collection
of historical materials

Dr. E J Thomas: I shall refer to it in my book and hope to make further use of it

Mahamahopadhyaya Dr Ganganath Jha It fully maintains the standard of the earlier volumes

Dr M Winternitz — * * * It is a highly interesting and most valuable contribution to Indian history. As a careful collection of historical materials from the Veda down to the Puranas and the Jatakas, it will be welcome to every student of Indian history and literature. I am glad to see that you have refrained from building up more or less doubtful theories and hypotheses and have given only the solid facts about the Kurus, Pancalas, Matsyas and all the most important tribes of Madhyadesa.
* * *

Dr E W Hopkins — * * * substantial volume * * * very succinct and comprehensive account of these various tribes, the continuation of which to full completion will be a most valuable contribution to Hindu history, a branch of science in which I rejoice that so many fine scholars are now fruitfully occupied in India itself. No longer will it be possible to say that 'history is a subject in which India has never taken any interest'. When you come to deal with the Pandavas I shall be curious to learn how you treat them in reference to the other epic data, which apparently you accept as good material valid for an early period, though how early you are discreet enough not to say. I am glad to see that you reject totemism as an explanation of Matsya, etc.

Dr D R Bhandarkar — * * * Like your other publications this also shows a valuable piece of scholarship, and I have no doubt it will prove very helpful to all students of the Ancient History of India.

Dr S M Edwardes — * * * I liked your Mid Indian Ksatriya Tribes very much. I have sent a review of it to the *Indian Antiquary*. I quite believe that there is more in Indian tradition than some have been disposed to think. And after the excavation of the Minorian civilisation at Knossos in Crete, one never knows what may be discovered in India in years to come. There may be found definite proof that matters

now regarded as more or less mythical were actual historical facts, like the Minotaur in Crete, etc.

Dr. Jarl Charpentier: an extensive collection of material which is undoubtedly of value to the scholar and student alike. gives *an ample in parts perhaps too ample--collection of passages from Brahmin and Buddhist authors concerning these different peoples* puts before his readers the *first-hand materials* as far as accessible.

Indian Review, July, 1925: In this volume Dr. Law supplements the work done by other scholars, and gives us a detailed account, historical and geographical, of the Ksatriya tribes of the Doab, like the Panchalas, the Matsyas, the Surasenas, the Usinaias, etc. He traces the fortunes of the Kurus from their original amalgamation with the Rig Vedic Bharathas, their growing prominence in the Brahmanas and the Upanishadas, the tradition about the origin of the Kuru dynasty, the great war between its two branches, and the Kuru kings mentioned in Buddhist literature. He discusses the origin of the name Panchalas, the Panchala regions and cities and the part of the country as told in Pali books. The fortunes of the Surasena tribe are next traced. The Vasas of the Brahmana literature are identified with the Vamsas of the Pali books. The documenting and get up of the book leave nothing to be desired.

Indian Historical Quarterly, Vol. I., No. 1, March 1925: Dr. Law has laid the students of ancient Indian History under deep obligation by his interesting studies on the Ksatriya tribes of ancient India. The historians of ancient India generally regard the sixth century B.C. as the line of demarcation between historical and prehistorical period, but already signs are not wanting that the line is to be pushed back to a considerable degree. Mr. Paigiter was the first scholar to draw the attention of the learned world in this direction and among

the small band of workers who has followed in his footsteps Dr Law occupies a distinct position. In the volume under review he has collected together data from various sources about the Kurus, the Pancalas, the Matsyas, the Surasenas, the Cedis, the Vatsas (whom the author regards as identical with the Vedic Vatsas), the Avantis and the Usinoras. For this purpose he has laid under contribution both Brahmanical and Buddhist literature and his references are fairly exhaustive. The author has also referred to the coins and inscriptions, but it is obvious that he did not intend to treat them fully. * * * real value of the book lies in its treatment of the literary data and the author has done a great service by bringing them together. The time for writing a connected history of the ancient Ksatriya tribes has not yet come but the groundwork has been well laid and we hope the main structure will be raised upon it at no distant date. We hope Dr Law will continue his researches in the same direction and help to bridge over the gulf that at present separates the early period of Indian history from what we may call the beginnings of historical period.

J R A S October 1925 —We often meet now a days with the name of Dr B C Law in the fields of research on the history of Ancient India and on Buddhism. Within a quite short time he has published nearly a dozen different books, all bearing witness to his zeal and his interest in the ancient history of India.

The present writer sometime ago had the pleasure of reading his book, *Some Ksatryia Tribes of Ancient India* and found it to be an extensive collection of materials which is undoubtedly of value to the scholar and student alike. The same can fairly well be said of the author's present work, which is in a way merely a continuation of the former one. Here Dr Law deals with such important tribes as the Kurus, Pancalas, Matsya, Surasenas, etc., and gives ample—in parts perhaps too ample—collection of passages from

Brahmin and Buddhist authors concerning these different peoples. We understand it to be the learned author's chief aim to put before his reader the first-hand materials as far as accessible, in quoting modern literature dealing with these subjects he has been very sparing, which after all, is perhaps as well.

Indian Antiquary, December, 1925. Dr Law's work is frankly an attempt to present a detailed account of the ancient Indo-Aryan tribes which occupied the valley of the Upper Ganges and its tributaries in prehistoric times. Starting from tradition as embodied in ancient Sanskrit and Pali works and checking it with other literary and archaeological material, Dr Law gives all the information obtainable about the Kurus, who appear as the Bharatas in the Vedic Age and are connected with the Pancalas in the Brahmanas, the Pancalas who were originally termed Kurus and are mentioned both in Buddhist literature and in the Arthashastra of Kautilya; the Matsyas, orthodox followers of Brahmanism who are mentioned in the Rig Veda and the Brahmanas and are associated with the Cedis and Surasenas in the Epics and Puranas, the Surasenas who are first mentioned as skilled in the Code of Manu and whose capital Mathura was a long time the centre of Krishna worship and later the cradle of the Bhagavata religion, the Chedis who also date back to the Vedic Age and later were divided into two branches, one of which occupied Bundelkhand and the other Nepal, the Vasas or Vatsas, a Rig Vedic tribe whose capital Kausambi not far from the modern Allahabad, became a great trade centre in a later age, the Avantis who are mentioned for the first time in the Mahabharata and were connected with the Yadus and Kuntis of western India, and the Usinarias about whom little or nothing is known.

Despite the difficulties of this task Dr Law contrived to compile a most interesting work. As Dr Barnett remarks,

he has spared no effort to make an exhaustive and careful collection of the materials that Indian tradition offers, together with many relevant data from other sources that will aid in the construction of a critical history. Dr Law's book needs no higher recommendation than this.

III

ANCIENT INDIAN TRIBES, Vol. I.

Contents *The Kasis* — *The Kosalas* — *The Asmakas* or *Assakas* — *The Magadhas* — *The Bhojas*

Prof. E. J. Rapson: It is most useful to have the widely scattered information thus gathered together in one volume

Dr. A. B. Keith: Your new book adds materially to your valuable service in the collation and exposition of facts of Indian History. It is clearly with you a labour of love, and I am sure that we all appreciate the excellent work you are doing

Dr. D. R. Bhandarkar. I have perused it with extreme interest. I envy you for the fecundity of your output whose scholarship is in no way marred thereby

The Indian Review, July 1927. The author of this book, a distinguished graduate of the Calcutta University, has already given proof of his work by his monograph on Ksatīya Clans in Buddhist India (Calcutta, Thacker Spink & Co), and his Ancient Mid-Indian Ksatīya Tribes, Vol. I (Calcutta Oriental Series, Thacker Spink & Co). While in these two books he made use of the traditions embodied in the Epics, the Puranas, and the canonical works of the Buddhists and the Jains, besides other sources of information both literary and archaeological, in the book under review he deals with the five tribes—the Kasis, the Kosalas, the Assakas, the Magadhas and the Bhojas who played an important part in our ancient history. He has culled his materials from Sanskrit, Pali and Prakrit literatures and blended them with the essence of the legends connected with these tribes. For each tribe, he gives the location, extent and boundaries of its habitat, the part that it played in the Epics and the Puranas and the literature of the

Buddhists and the Jains, as well as the importance of the chief cities interspersed with features of their social life. The book is good evidence of the patient industry at sifting and collation of much useful matter from recondite sources.

Journal of Indian History April 1927—The history of ancient India is still in the making. In spite of decades of research by both Western and Eastern savants, our knowledge of ancient Indian historical facts is still meagre. There are still knotty problems that await final solution. One such intricate subject is the state of India in prehistoric times. It is generally admitted—and we are afraid on very slender evidence,—that there was a tribal stage out of which evolved the state consciousness. Dr Law, a distinguished student of ancient Indian literature, has been devoting himself to this particular subject for several years past and the present work is the outcome of his strenuous labours.

The book contains a study of five ancient tribes—the Kasis, the Kosalis, the Asmakas, the Magadhas, and the Bhojas. The author has left no source unexploited in the matter of treating each of these kingdoms. The history of each country or kingdom is begun from the Vedic times and carried on to the historical period with a wealth of detail all culled out from both Sanskrit and Pali literature. After completely reading every page of the book, if we would ask ourselves the question, whether we can admit of different tribes occupying these territories, the answer seems to be more on the negative side. Let us, for example, take the chapters on the Kasis and the Kosalis.

As for the Kasis, whether from *Anguttara Nilaya*, the Epics, the Puranas or the Chinese version of *Tsin-shi*, it is not possible for us to say that the term Kasis was the name of a tribe. It would appear from the *Harivamsa* that the sons of Kasi, king of the Anenah dynasty were known as the Kasis. Again there is no mention of Kosulas as the name of a people in literature. The origin of the term *Kosala* from *Kusalam*

as given in the Buddhaghosa is indeed interesting. As the author himself has pointed out the term plural Kosalan is used in the Ramayana not to denote the peoples but the Kosala regions. These and other facts confirm more and more our supposition that the terms Kasis, Kosalas, etc., did not represent the name of any separate tribe but offshoots of a great family of princes like the Ikshvaksus. Hence it would be fitting if the book is entitled *Ancient Indian Kingdoms*. These small states seem to have been independent, each striving to absorb the other by conquest or by marriage relations.

The book is a careful study of the different kingdoms. The author has perhaps exhausted all the available sources of information. It is an encyclopædia of information on the respective kingdoms. The printing and get-up are good.

Statesman, August 21, 1927. How many tribes there were in ancient India it is difficult to estimate but scholars versed in Sanskrit and Pali have been able to trace the history of an appreciable number. Dr. Law has dealt with only five of them, *viz*, Kasis, Kosalas, Assakas, Magadhas and Bhojas all of whom played important parts in the history of ancient India. Doings of the people belonging to these races were recorded mostly in Pali and Prakrit which were the spoken languages of ancient India. Dr. Law has ransacked the whole of the literature written in these languages and embodied the result of his research in this book. He has further taken the legends connected with each of these five tribes and succeeded in presenting a systematic history of them. The most refreshing feature of the book is that the author has nowhere tried to thrust his conclusions on the reader. He has chronicled the history of each tribe as gathered from ancient sources and left the reader free to form his own conclusion regarding its civilization and achievements. Students interested in the ancient culture and civilization of India in prehistoric days will find the book profitable reading.

Forward January 23 1927 —The publishers, Punjab Oriental Sanskrit Book Depot, have taken upon themselves the publication of rare and unpublished books relating to ancient India, edited by well known and eminent scholars, oriental, as well as occidental. The present book of Dr Law forms the twelfth publication in it. Dr Law has already made his mark in his writings about ancient India and particularly on the Buddhist period of her political and cultural history. He has maintained in this book the spirit of original research that he has displayed in his previous works.

The book under review deals with five tribes of ancient India who played an important part in her history. They are the Kasis, the Kosalis, the Assulis, the Madhvis and the Bhojas. In dealing with these Dr Law breaks out in a line different from those adopted by other scholars who have preceded him in this sphere and that is one of the distinctive marks of this work. Dr Law has stopped with a careful collection and correct presentation of materials delineating the different aspects of life and history of the tribes he has dealt with here but refrained from building up doubtful theories and hypotheses from these. Still this simple presentation of solid facts does not fail to give us a comprehensive view of the whole thing.

In writing this book Dr Law has freely drawn from the original works in Sanskrit, Pali and Pralrit. He has also utilised the legends connected with these tribes. The book contains 4 plates.

The Modern Review September 1927 —The early history of India still remains to be written. We have not yet got any systematic and complete history of early India—both political and cultural from any scholar. We have only a few scholars here and there, who are just reconstructing a few phases of the early Indian history. We know that in ancient India there were many tribes which tried to establish their kingdoms in

various parts of India. In the present work Dr Law tries to trace the history of the Kasis, Kosalas, Asmakas, Magadhas and the Bhojas. He has utilised all the available materials from the Sanskrit, Pali and Jain sources. The book is published in the Punjab Sanskrit Series, which deserve to be patronised by the educated Indians. Dr Law has done good work in collecting all the facts about these ancient Indian Tribes.

Indian Antiquary, November 1927: It is generally admitted that like most countries in the world, ancient India in prehistoric days evolved out of a tribal stage into a settled order of society. What were the names of these tribes, where and how they lived, whence and from which place they came, and what led finally to their absorption are questions, an examination of which would afford supreme interest to antiquarians. We know Vedic literature contains mention of a few tribes. Again these and other tribes are not unknown to post-vedic literature—a clear inference that tribal systems of organisation contained to thrive even in the Epic and the Pauranic periods.

But there are striking pieces of evidence to indicate that even in pre-epic days, and at least by the epic age, India had evolved a settled system of government and administration. It is not possible for us to say whether tribal systems of organisation continued side by side with the orderly forms of government. But it is just possible that each tribe gradually developed a sense of state consciousness with the result that each became dominant in that region. Or it may be that originally there was a great family of princes and rulers like the traditional race of the Ikshvaks, the different members of which occupied neighbouring territories and became in course of time independent rulers. Whatever it was, the fact was that there were small separate kingdoms occupied by different monarchs and possibly different peoples.

An attempt is made in the book under review to trace the history of five such tribes which played a prominent part

in the history of ancient India. These are the Kasis, the Kosalas, the Asmakas, the Magadhas, and the Bhojas. The study of each tribe is an exhaustive one, from its origin to its final disappearance or absorption into other powerful territory. This is not the first endeavour of Dr Law in this direction. He has already published similar studies with an earnestness all his own. Almost all his authorities are literary, and each one of them is furnished with a wealth of detail that one must call it a study complete by itself.

We trust that the distinguished scholar will pursue his studies further and give us an authoritative and exhaustive treatise on all the tribal kingdoms of Hindu India both in her prehistoric and historical periods.

J R A S October 1927 —The "Ancient Indian Tribes" who receive Dr Law's attention in this book are the Kasis, Kosalas, Asmakas or Assakas, Magadhas, and Bhojas. Dr Law gives in English a summary of the references to them in the Buddhist and Jain Scriptures, the Atharvashikhas, the Epics, several Puranas and a number of other works, ancient and modern, and he has for the most part deliberately abstained from criticism of the historical and mythical statements compiled by him. His work is thus a Repertorium and as such is useful.

J A O S June 1929 —'Ancient Indian Tribes' contains all that is mentioned in ancient literature regarding the five tribes of Kasis, Kosalas, Assakas, Magadhas, and Bhojas, a useful collection, though including many trivial details culled from fables.

IV

ANCIENT INDIAN TRIBES, Vol. II.

Contents The *Vangas* — The *Suhmas* — The *Gaudas* — The *Pandras* — The *Sindhu-Sauras* — The *Surāstras* — The *Mulatas* — The *Mulatas* — The *Dasarnas* — The *Kaynas* — The *Ambas* — The *Mulatas* — The *Yaudheyas* — The *Sibs* — The *Kotayas* — The *Abbas* — The *Trigattas* — The *Vahlitas* — The *Nivas* — The *Nisadhas*

E. J. Rapson: Your interesting, useful and valuable book
I have read it with great interest and shall preserve it carefully
for future reference

Oldham; It is a valuable compilation, full of useful references
helping towards the location of these ancient tribes a matter
of much importance for the understanding of the history of
their times

Barnett: An excellent and most useful work

E. J. Thomas: It is a worthy successor to your former work
and with its multitude of valuable references and facts
will be an important contribution to our geographical knowledge
of India

Sten Konow: You give us the results of your research work in a
clear and perspicuous style and we have every reason for being
thankful to you for what you have done

R. Kern, Leiden: I have read it with great interest and I think
it very illuminating

Amritabazar Patrika: Dr Law must be given credit for issuing
this companion volume to his well-known works on the tribes,
Some Ksatriya Tribes of Ancient India, Ancient Mid-Indian
Ksatriya Tribes, and Ancient Indian Tribes, all of which are
regarded as works of outstanding and sterling merit Here
in this book which is at once concise and comprehensive,

Dr Law has compressed a great deal of historical and geographical information concerning some 20 tribes of ancient India, namely, the Vāgas, the Suhmas, the Gaudas, the Pundras, the Sindhu Sauvīras, the Surāstras, the Mulaḥas, the Mekas, the Dāsakas, the Kāruṣas, the Ambasthas, the Mulaḥas, the Yaudheyas, the Sibis, the Kekayas, the Abhiras, the Trigarttas, the Vahlis, the Nisadas, and the Nisadhās. So far as the tribes dealt with are concerned this is undoubtedly the first book on the subject. In the preparation of this work the author has not only utilised the original Sanskrit, Pali and Pāli literature, but numismatic and epigraphic materials as well. The documentation of the book is careful, and throughout there is an unmistakable stamp of thoroughness and sound scholarship characteristic of Dr Law's other works. Students of ancient Indian History and Geography will find the book to be of great use to them.

MAHAVIRA: HIS LIFE & TEACHINGS

Contents *Life — Teachings*

Sir Francis Younghusband: I have been greatly interested in reading and learning something of Indian life in those ancient times

Otto Schrader: It was a real enjoyment for me to read your little book on Mahavira which I consider the best short introduction to Jainism existing at present. There is of course Mr Jain's "Outlines of Jainism" which is also quite useful but your book is more suitable as a first introduction for Western readers and has moreover the advantage of being helpful even to those who are familiar with Jainism, *viz*, by its making all possible use also of the Buddhist sources.

L. D. Barnett: The book is a model of its kind, being clear, accurate, succinct and objective

W Geiger: I read it with great interest and I am quite agreeing with you as regards the importance of the Buddhist canonical books for a true understanding of Jainism and of the whole contemporaneous religious or philosophical movement.

Otto Stein: I have read the book with interest and I have found that you understood to give the reader a picture of India during the activities of many leaders, two among whom got fame and founded religious and speculative systems. I was interested in your comparison between the two systems in their inner and outer forms.

C. E. A. W. Oldham: It is a pleasure to read this very suggestive account of the great Apostle's life and teachings written in a spirit of impartiality and aloofness from such little prejudices

that so often vitiate to some extent the writings of the sectarians (whether Digambara or Svetāmbara)

The course you have adopted of collating the information to be culled from the Buddhist canon—of which you have so unrivalled knowledge—with the evidence of the Jain *Agama* is an excellent one, and I think you have been able to shed further light upon several points in issue

Sir Edward MacLagan —You have been able to present in this book the fruit of much study and learning and I am not myself acquainted with any such clear and comprehensive account elsewhere of Mahavira's life and teachings

Stede —The book is scholarly, reliable and useful

Hindu dated 6 6 37 —The author has made a comparative study of both Buddhist and Jain sources and has established the historicity of Mahavira and his predecessor, Parsva. The author clearly shows that Mahavira's teachings added one more law, to the then existing four laws of Parsva, the law about chastity. The author's analysis of the Kriyāvāda of Jainism as distinguished from the Kriyāvāda of Buddhism and other systems of thought is interesting. The answer to the question whether the world is eternal or non eternal given in a Jain Text mentioned by the author in page 73 suggests a way of escape from the position of the dogmatist and the sceptic. The general public interested in comparative religion and the Jains will welcome this book.

Amrita Bazar Patrika dated 28 3 37 —Dr Law writes with unrivalled authority on Buddhist literature and culture, but here in the work under review he shows his competence to speak with authority on Jain themes as well. Within the brief space of some 113 pages Dr Law successfully presents here an admirable account of the life and teachings of Mahavira, based upon a massive survey of original Buddhist and Jain

texts, incidentally depicting also the social, political, economic, religious and other conditions of the time in which the founder of Jainism lived, moved and preached. The value and importance of Dr. Law's work lie in the fact that the comparative study of the Buddhist and Jain texts that he has furnished here enables one greatly to have clear notions on many of the knotty points in the life and doctrines of Mahavira. A very lucid exposition of the different aspects of his teachings is given by Dr. Law in the second part of his work.

Indian Historical Quarterly, Vol. XIII, No. 1, 1937:—Dr. Bimala Churn Law has presented us once more with a work marked by the characteristic features of all his writings. There is the same accuracy, the same careful choice of facts, the same objectivity and sobriety of judgment. Hence, despite all that has been written on Mahavira, it would be difficult to find any book better suited to give an objective account of what we learn from the Buddhist and Jain texts regarding the real founder of Jainism, for we must not give too much credence to efforts to ascribe the faith to the legendary Parsvanatha. The use of Buddhist texts in this connection is of special importance, for the Pali canon has survived in a far better shape than the Jain, and its testimony has the additional value that it is not marked by sympathy for the tenets of the Jains. Dr. Law expounds with much sympathy the doctrines which we may safely ascribe to the founder himself and those which later developed. All Jains and those interested in their position in Indian religious and philosophical thought must be grateful to the author for so sound and helpful a book. (Reviewed by Dr. A. Bernadale Keith)

Quarterly Journal of the Mythic Society, New Series, Vol. XXVII, Nos. 3 & 4, January-April, 1937: As claimed by Dr. Law in his Preface, the treatise before us "will be found useful by all persons interested in the study of Jainism." The

method pursued by him to reconstruct an account of the life and teachings of Mahavira—the founder of Jainism—the last of the Tirthankaras, is useful and reliable. While the Jain texts afford direct evidence of Mahavira's life and teachings, the Buddhist texts afford collateral evidence for confirming or rejecting details.

Dr Law has not only sketched the main events of Mahavira's life but depicted a fairly vivid picture of "the social, political, economic, religious and other conditions of the time in which Mahavira lived, moved and preached."

The events of Mahavira's life are of absorbing interest, particularly the penance and austerities of over twelve years which this scion of the princely house of Jnātri Kshatriyas of Vaisālī underwent before he attained the highest knowledge and intuition, called Kevala, at the age of forty two.

His teachings, however, are of even greater interest. Even to day, twenty four centuries after his passing away, they command the faith and ennoble the lives of over a million Indians. Their main principles of *Ahimsa* and *Kriyavada* or *Karmavada* have entered into the marrow of all Hindu thought.

The goal of life according to him, is "*Sukha*" or infinite bliss. This infinite bliss is not reachable through the finite happiness of even so fortunate among men as the reigning monarchs. A characteristic slogan of his immediate disciples was "Had it been possible to obtain bliss through worldly happiness, King Bimbisāra of Magadha would certainly have obtained it."

This infinite bliss is attainable by human efforts. The ultimate object of Jainism is Nirvana which "consists in peace." Nirvana is just another name of *Moksha* or liberation, *Mukti* or deliverance. And it is open to all. Mahavira's great message to mankind is that birth is nothing, that caste is nothing, and that *Karma* is everything, and on the destruction

texts, incidentally depicting also the social, political, economic, religious and other conditions of the time in which the founder of Jainism lived, moved and preached. The value and importance of Dr. Law's work lie in the fact that the comparative study of the Buddhist and Jain texts that he has furnished here enables one greatly to have clear notions on many of the knotty points in the life and doctrines of Mahavira. A very lucid exposition of the different aspects of his teachings is given by Dr. Law in the second part of his work.

Indian Historical Quarterly, Vol XIII, No. 1, 1937: Dr Bimala Churn Law has presented us once more with a work marked by the characteristic features of all his writings. There is the same accuracy, the same careful choice of facts, the same objectivity and sobriety of judgment. Hence, despite all that has been written on Mahavira, it would be difficult to find any book better suited to give an objective account of what we learn from the Buddhist and Jain texts regarding the real founder of Jainism, for we must not give too much credence to efforts to ascribe the faith to the legendary Parsvanatha. The use of Buddhist texts in this connection is of special importance, for the Pali canon has survived in a far better shape than the Jain, and its testimony has the additional value that it is not marked by sympathy for the tenets of the Jains. Dr. Law expounds with much sympathy the doctrines which we may safely ascribe to the founder himself and those which later developed. All Jains and those interested in their position in Indian religious and philosophical thought must be grateful to the author for so sound and helpful a book. (Reviewed by Dr A Berniedale Keith)

Quarterly Journal of the Mythic Society, New Series, Vol. XXVII, Nos. 3 & 4, January-April, 1937:- As claimed by Dr Law in his Preface, the treatise before us "will be found useful by all persons interested in the study of Jainism." The

method pursued by him to reconstruct an account of the life and teachings of Mahavira—the founder of Jainism—the last of the Tirthankaras, is useful and reliable. While the Jain texts afford direct evidence of Mahavira's life and teachings, the Buddhist texts afford collateral evidence for confirming or rejecting details.

Dr Law has not only sketched the main events of Mahavira's life but depicted a fairly vivid picture of "the social, political, economic, religious and other conditions of the time in which Mahavira lived, moved and preached."

The events of Mahavira's life are of absorbing interest, particularly the penance and austerities of over twelve years which this scion of the princely house of Jñātri Kshatriyas of Vaisālī underwent before he attained the highest knowledge and intuition, called Kevala, at the age of forty two.

His teachings, however, are of even greater interest. Even to-day, twenty four centuries after his passing away, they command the faith and ennoble the lives of over a million Indians. Their main principles of *Ahimsa* and *Kriyavada* or *Karmavada* have entered into the marrow of all Hindu thought.

The goal of life according to him, is "*Sukha*" or infinite bliss. This infinite bliss is not reachable through the finite happiness of even so fortunate among men as the reigning monarchs. A characteristic slogan of his immediate disciples was "Had it been possible to obtain bliss through worldly happiness, King Bimbisāra of Magadha would certainly have obtained it."

This infinite bliss is attainable by human efforts. The ultimate object of Jainism is Nirvana which "consists in peace." Nirvana is just another name of *Moksha* or liberation, *Mukti* or deliverance. And it is open to all. Mahavira's great message to mankind is that birth is nothing, that caste is nothing, and that *Karma* is everything, and on the destruction

an account of the life and teachings of Mahavira the details are valuable and some deserve careful consideration (Review by Glasenoff).

Journal of Indian History, Dec. 1937, Vol. XVI., pt. 3 (Serial No. 48): Dr Law's comparative study of the original Buddhist and Jain tenets has enabled him to elucidate some doubtful points of Mahavira's life and doctrine. Mahavira belonged to the Jnātin Ksatriyas. He was Nirgrantha because he was outwardly unclothed and inwardly free from all worldly bonds and ties. His teachings are examined in a second section and it is pointed out how the main system of Jainism came to be represented as *navatatva* or doctrine of nine categories. His teachings are said to lead to the extinction of Karma and attainment of perfection. The book is well-written and will be found useful by all students of Jaina religion and history. (Reviewed by V R R Dikshitar)

VI

HISTORICAL GLEANINGS

Contents *Taxila as a seat of learning in Sanskrit and Pali Literature — The Wandering teachers in the time of the Buddha — Influence of the five heretical teachers on Jainism and Buddhism — Buddhaghosa's Commentaries — The Jeecharis in Ancient India — Buddha and Vajras*

Dr E J Thomas —The book gives much more information of Buddhist notion than can be gained from the usual books

Rao Shaheb Dr S Krishnaswami Aiyanger —I have read through the book now with great pleasure and not without profit. I was particularly impressed with Chapters 2 and 3 which give us an idea of the character of the intellectual fervour in the Indian Society of the 6th Century B C. Buddhism and Jainism could not well be studied as isolated phenomena and your sketches give the best evidence of proof in regard to this thesis

Sir George Grierson —I have read the book with much interest and to this I may add that I have done so with pleasure

Indian Antiquary August 1923 —This is a brief collection of essays. Law is enabled to show that these teachers belonged to one and the same period of thought development in India and prepared the way for the doctrine of the Buddha. The chapter on Buddhaghosa's commentaries will well repay perusal and is one of the best features of this little book, which provides in a convenient compass some of the salient facts deducible from an examination of Buddhist literature

The Young Men of India September 1924 — * * * a collection of essays. The several pieces are all historical in character. They make pleasant reading and open out vistas

into the dim past. The book will, undoubtedly, repay perusal by adding to one's stock of historical information.

J. R. A. S., October 1924: six essays on ancient Indian History, information regarding Taxila as a seat of learning, wandering teachers of Buddha's time, the influence of the five heretical teachers on Jainism and Buddhism, Buddhaghosa and his commentaries, the Licchavis and Buddha and the Niganthas. We are most grateful to the author for collecting these essays in permanent form.

VII

GEOGRAPHY OF EARLY BUDDHISM

Contents *Sources — Buddhist Conception of India — Divisions of India —
Mayhimagada — Uttarapatha — Aparantala — Dakkhinapatha —
Pracya — Ceylon Burma and other Foreign Countries*

- Dr E J Thomas** — * * * very useful and interesting work
Besides the addition to our knowledge which it gives it will
be extremely useful in bringing to a head many of the points
on which scholars still disagree
- Dr Radhakumud Mookerji** — This is one more link in the chain
of works by which students of Indian History will be bound to
you for what you have done to restore some of its lost chapters
You have now made the subject of Buddhist India in all its
aspects as your own, leaving very little to be done in that
field
- Dr Keith** — * * * congratulate you on another example of
erudition and sound exposition Your work in rendering avail-
able the facts of early Indian life and thought is highly appre-
ciated and it is a matter of great satisfaction that Indian history
is now passing into the stage where workers have ready access
to the essential facts
- Prof E J Rapson** — * * * have read with great interest and
shall keep it carefully for reference
- Dr F W Thomas** — * * * I congratulate you upon its publi-
cation It has the advantage of an index and map which
should materially enhance its utility I think it will be very
serviceable for reference and you are to be congratulated upon
a deed of merit
- Sir George A Grierson** — It will be a valuable help to all students
not only of Buddhist, but also of Hindu history

Rai Bahadur Daya Ram Sahni: I have perused this book with great interest and look forward to making abundant use of it in connection with my archaeological studies

Dr. M Winternitz: * * * the most useful It is a welcome contribution to historical geography of ancient India

Dr. F. O Schrader: * * * Your "Geography of Early Buddhism" was a great surprise for me This is indeed the kind of work which I have often missed when reading in the Pitakas and which, I am sure, every Indologist will welcome as a great boon I admire the pains you have taken in collecting every available material on the subject This will become an indispensable work of reference for all of us * * * You are acquiring very great merits in the field of Buddhist research * * * your valuable gift. * * * Your presence in Rome in 1934 would greatly please many of your European colleagues who know your books and are, like myself, desirous of making your personal acquaintance

Dr. Th Stcherbatsky: This book answers to a longfelt need and will be highly appreciated by all students of Buddhist India

Prof A V Williams Jackson: * * * your valuable Geography of Early Buddhism I am glad to have such a book on my shelves

Dr W. Geiger: * * * valuable present * * * I congratulate you on the interesting subject you have chosen and on the excellent manner in which you have mastered it The distinction of the "five Indies" is very good and makes the whole arrangement of the book clear and lucid.

Dr L D. Barnett: * * * An exceedingly able and useful work

Dr Sten Konow: * * * An extremely useful work, which it will be convenient to consult, as occasion arises, in order to see at a glance what the various sources actually say about some old place-names.

Mon L Finot — * * * welcome as a help to the study of Tipitaka and a valuable contribution to the future Geographical Dictionary of Ancient India

Dr W Stede — * * * I have found it extremely useful and instructive. It contains a tremendous wealth of materials
* * *

The Buddhist December 1932 — The above is the title of the latest work of Dr B C Law, the famous research scholar, who has contributed not less than twenty valuable volumes to Buddhist literature. It is preceded by a foreword from the able pen of Dr F W Thomas.

The present work deals entirely with the ancient countries, cities, rivers, mountains, etc., which existed in India and to which references are found in Pali literature. The learned writer has very laboriously collected all the necessary details from both Pali and Sanskrit works. Wherever possible the author has attempted to identify the ancient places and give the modern names.

The book consists of six chapters. The first five chapters deal with the Majjhimadesa or the Middle country, Uttarapatha or the Northern India, Aprantaka or the Western India, Dakkhinapatha or the Deccan and the Far South, and Pracya or the Eastern country. The last chapter is devoted to Ceylon, Burma and other Foreign countries. Most of the important places of historical interest in Ceylon as mentioned in the Mahavamsa and Dipavamsa are found in this chapter.

In an appendix the writer speaks of the significance of the term Cetiya. The map annexed to the book is extremely helpful. We recommend this useful work to every student interested in the geography of early Buddhism.

The Amrita Bazar Patrika, 18th December 1932 — Dr B C Law has surely earned the gratitude of all students of Ancient Indian History and Culture by adding to the rapidly growing

collection of Indological literature a work of outstanding importance. He has presented in the volume under review an interesting and readable survey of the geographical condition of India at a time when Buddhism was still in a nascent state. It is a pioneer work and for the matter of that Dr Law's task has been obviously a very difficult one. Some idea of the difficulty Dr Law has to experience in bringing out this book may be gathered from the fact that there is in the Buddhist literature no professed manual of geography and the stupendous mass of information that is contained in the volume has to be arduously gleaned from the vast and perplexing body of Buddhist canonical and noncanonical works. Not only that. He has to supplement this information with the data carefully picked up from the early inscriptions, Jain and Brahmanical literature and the itineraries of the Chinese pilgrims. As a result of this patient and untiring labour on the part of the learned author we have in this book an immense repository of geographical facts and details. That is splendid, but still more welcome is its other aspect. In ancient India, it must be remembered, geography and history were inextricably bound up with each other and for that reason we have in the pages of this book constant reference to the history of the period it covers of Buddha and the early dissemination of Buddhism. And what is remarkable is that everything has been presented in a highly systematic way with considerable literary skill. It is, in short, historical geography at its finest expression and accomplishment whose interest cannot be exaggerated and whose value is no less.

The book is organised into six chapters, besides an introduction and an appendix. The introduction discusses the sources of information and gives an exposition of the Buddhist conception of India. In the five chapters that follow, the author successively takes up as his theme, each of the five regions into which ancient India was divided both in the Buddhist and Brahmanical literature. The first chapter deals with the geography of *Majjhimadesa* or the Middle

Country and as that was the principal theatre of the activities of Buddha and the early Buddhists it naturally occupies the major portion of the book, in fact half the space at the disposal of the author. After indicating with some details the boundaries of the Māgghimadesa, the author gives here an exhaustive description of the towns, cities and countries of the mahājanapadas and the janapadas, of the nigamas, nagaras and gramas, of the rivers, lakes and tanks, of the mountains, hills and caves, of the parks, forests and jungles and finally of the cities, gramas and viharas located within the middle country.

Chapters II—V which deal with the geography of Uttarapatha or the Northern India, Aparantaka or the Western India, Dāśarhinapatha or the Deccan and the Far South and the Pracya or the Eastern Country, also receive the same exhaustive treatment as the first one. And this is also the case with the last chapter which is devoted to the description of the geography of Ceylon, Burma and other foreign countries known to the early Indians. Finally we have in the Appendix a highly informative note on the significance of the Cetiya in the Buddhist literature. And before we close we must add that the author has considerably increased the value of the book by adding at the end a sketch map of ancient India as known to the early Buddhists and a comprehensive index of all the proper names treated in the volume.

Journal of Indian History Vol XI December 1932 —A close student of the Pāli Buddhist texts, Dr B. C. Law is an authority on the history of early Buddhism in India. * * * In the monograph under review Dr Law shows his acquaintance with the Buddhist literature, canonical and noncanonical. With regard to topics like the Geography of the land, the Hindu and Buddhist writers practically agreed. * * * The monograph on the geography of early Buddhism is really the geography of ancient India. * * * The book is divided into six chapters—the Māgghadesa or the middle country, Uttarapatha or North India, Aparantaka or Western India, Dakṣinapatha

ancient India, such as can be drawn from the Pali Buddhist Texts. In doing this he adopted the traditional division of the country into Majjhimadesa or the Middle Country, Uttarapatha or Northern India, Aparantaka or Western India, Dakkhinapatha or Southern India and Pracya or the Eastern Country, to which foreign countries like Baveru (Babylon), Lankadipa (Ceylon) and Suvannabhumi (Lower Burma) are added. Under each division he gives first a description of the boundaries, then that of the subdivisions, towns, villages, rivers, lakes, mountains, hills, caves, parks, forests and jungles. The huge bulk of references is taken from the Pali Literature but there are other sources as well, like the Asokan inscriptions, Sanskrit Buddhist Literature or the itineraries of Chinese pilgrims. The cradle of Buddhism lies in the Middle Country and it is no wonder that this is the country of which our texts have an intimate knowledge, far better than that of the outlying tracts. B Ch Law has carefully studied every available text serving his purpose and collected a good many informations. The book is a source of information to every student interested in ancient Indian geography.

V Lesny

VIII

GEOGRAPHICAL ESSAYS, Vol I

Contents *Geographical data from Sanskrit Buddhist literature — South India as a Centre of Early Buddhism — Geographical data from Mahāvamsa and its Commentary — Dāṃila and Dāṃilarattha — Mountains and rivers of India — Countries and peoples of India — Kapilavastu — Buddhist Cave temples in India — Sacred places of the Jains — Sacred places of the Varshnavas*

Mr Oldham —Your careful and persevering researches in this respect will help very materially towards the preparation of a much needed work, an Atlas of the ancient geography of India. For the period of the Buddha you have already collected practically all the references available.

Dr Barnett —It is a really valuable digest of information which I am very glad to possess.

Dr Keith —It is a most valuable collection, rich in accurately stated and carefully collected facts and lays all students once more under a deep debt of gratitude.

Dr Stede —I find this handy collection very useful. You are indeed rendering splendid and unselfish service to all oriental scholars.

Amrita Bazar Patrika 17th October 1937 —People interested in the study and understanding of ancient India owe a deep debt of gratitude to the erudition of Dr B C Law of international reputation for a large number of monographs embodying invaluable results of his indefatigable researches into India's glorious past. The monograph under review is a collection of useful and instructive articles relating to ancient geography of India, Burma and Ceylon, which already appeared in the

IX

SRAVASTI IN INDIAN LITERATURE

Contents *Introduction — Origin of the name and topography — Kosala and Sravasti — Jetavana and Parivarama — Sravasti in religious tradition — Decline of Sravasti*

F. W. Thomas: I have perused your excellent memoir on Sravasti. You have collected a large amount of information and the book shows that with careful examination the Pali texts may still shed further important light upon the condition of India during the early period. I am happy to possess this memoir.

E. J. Rapson. I have read your *memoir* with much pleasure.

L. D. Barnett: I would congratulate you on the admirable manner in which you have accomplished your difficult task of tracing Sravasti through literature, it is a most reliable contribution to science.

M. Winterntiz. Your excellent monograph on Sravasti. It adds one more to the long list of highly useful publications, which we already owe to you and adds also to our knowledge of the history of ancient India.

A. B. Keith: Your memoir is an excellent piece of work, full of information and completely free from unjustifiable speculation. I note you have corrected tacitly the mistake in the Cambridge History of India, Vol I, p 181, where reference is made to five Rajas discussing a point with Pasenadi. I note that you disagree with Raichaudhuri's belief that Jiyasatthu was a common designation of Kings. That suggestion reminds me of the conjecture at one time made by Rhys Davids (Buddhist India) that Pasenadi was an official epithet applied to several kings. It is curious that the commentators should

take *mahasala* as the equivalent of *mahasara* when it is perfectly obvious that the second element is *sala*

Amrita Bazar Patrika (the 12th January 1936) —Dr Bimala Churn Law whose fame as a distinguished Indologist rests on his meticulous researches into many of the difficult and intricate problems of Buddhist literature and culture, presents us here in this memoir a fascinating historico geographical account of the ancient city of Sravasti. Sravasti is a name to conjure with in the early history of India. It had unique importance as a centre of art, religion, culture and commerce. For eighteen hundred years from the time of the Buddha to the middle of the 12th century A.D. Sravasti had equally been recognised as a holy place of the Buddhists, the Ajivikas, the Jainas and the Brahmanas. The place naturally finds abundant mention in the literature of all the various sects. And it is of the relevant references that *Dr Law has made a critical study in the work under review*.

For the convenience of study, Dr Law has divided his monograph into five sections. Besides, there is an Introduction in which he briefly describes the excavation and exploration work done at Saheth Maheth (where Sravasti once stood) by Cunningham, Benet, Hoey, Vogel and Marshall. He refers to the few inscriptions that were unearthed at the place and summarises their contents adding his own interpretations to some of the expressions used in them. He then discusses the nature and style of the sculptures found at the site and explains their relation to the early School of Mathura and to the post Gupta Eastern School of Sarnath and Magadha. He next deals with the question of the origin of the name Sravasti, pointing out the disparity on this score between the Buddhist and the Brahmanical traditions. While the former would derive it from the sage Savattha, the latter, on the contrary, ascribes its foundation to King Sravasta, who according to one of the Puranas was a descendant of the famous king Ikshaku. The topography of the place is then discussed and its exact position

with reference to the river Achiravati or Rapti, and also to the the two well-known Buddhist monasteries of Jetavana and Pubbarama is clearly indicated. Mention is also made here of other places in the vicinity sacred to the Ajivikas, the Jainas and the Brahmanas.

The most comprehensive section of the monograph is the one in which the author with characteristic erudition presents a historical sketch of the kingdom of Kosala the prosperity of which depended to a great extent on that of its capital Sravasti which according to the commentaries of Buddhaghosha "accommodated fifty-seven thousand families and which was the principal source of income of the kingdom of Kasi-Kosala, comprising eighty thousand localities and extending over three leagues." A fact to be noted here in connection with the material prosperity of Sravasti was that it was not only the converging point of the three main trade-routes but was itself also a great mart of India. The commercial importance of the city is indeed very ably dealt with by the author, and the detailed description that he gives of the various trade routes shows that (like the roads of ancient Europe that all led to Rome) most of the roads of ancient India both from the South and the North, the East and the West had as their end the city of Sravasti.

But Sravasti was not merely a commercial city. It was more a religious one. And the eclectic character of Sravasti as a holy city, alike of Buddhists, the Jainas, the Ajivikas and the Brahmanas has been in an illuminating manner described by Dr. Law in a section entitled "Sravasti in Religious Tradition." Here he describes how at different periods of history Sravasti has been hallowed by the presence of the Buddha, Mahavira, Gosala Mankhaliputra, besides a host of eminent Buddhists, Jains, Ajivikas and Brahmanas. In this connection excellent description has also been given of the two Buddhist monasteries of Jetavana and Purvarama, which owed their origin to the munificent donation of the well-known

banker Sudatta Anathapindaka and Visakha the daughter in law of another banker named Migara. In the last section of the book is traced the story of the decline of the city of Sravasti, which as a stronghold of religion and art came to lose its importance after the middle of the 12th century.

On the whole, Dr Law has given us here in this book an admirable account of the great religious and commercial importance of the city of Sravasti. Throughout the monograph one finds a distinct stamp of the vast erudition which has always characterised Dr Law's writings. The monograph is well documented and there is an index at the end.

The Hindu (January 3 1936) —Dr Bimala Charan Law has made himself well known to the world of Buddhistic scholarship by his contributions on the traditions and literature of Buddhism, and this Memoir deals in full with Sravasti, the ancient capital of the Kosala country, specially held in veneration by the Buddhists as being one of the principal centres from where the Great Teacher gave his lasting message to humanity, the others being Champa, Rajagriha, Saketa, Kosambi and Varanasi. This city with its renowned monastery at Jeta vana was for a number of years hallowed by the presence of the Master. *The author has brought to bear on his task the literary materials that lie imbedded in Brahmanical, Buddhist and Jaina texts, as well as the itineraries of the two celebrated Chinese pilgrims, Fa Hien and Yuan Chwang. The result is an exhaustive account of an important centre of religion and art, that had a continuous period of activity from the time of the Buddha to the 12th century after Christ.*

The author deals first with the origin of the name and the topography of the locality, as described in the Pali texts and the Brahmanical literature, Epic and Puranic. In his introduction he makes a brief survey of the results of excavations in and around the town, and of the monuments

uneathed, sculptures examined, and inscriptions deciphered Kosala (Dakshina and Uttara) with its chief city Sravasti was not only a renowned centre of religion and culture but a great emporium of Indian trade. Its material prosperity was due to the fact that it was the meeting-place of three main trade-routes in North India. It was the habitation of a number of pre-eminent Brahmanas who were "old, aged, elderly and advanced in years" as of pious Buddhist monks and of Jaina teachers. The portion of the Memoir relating to the monasteries at Jeta-Vana and Purvarama is perhaps the most interesting, as it gives a detailed account of the life led in a monastic institution, which contained ample provision for study and meditation in its buildings and halls—to wit, Viharas (dwelling-rooms), Parivenas (retiring rooms), Kotthakas (store-rooms), Upatthana-salas (service-halls), Aggi-salas (fire-places), Kappiya-kutis (provision-houses), Vachcha-kutis (closets), Chankamas and Chankamana-salas (cloisters and gymnasiums), Udapanas and Udapana-salas (wells and watering-houses), Jantaghara-salas (baths and bathrooms), Pokkaranis (tanks) and Mandapas (pavilions). The section dealing with the decline of Sravasti speaks of the gradual fall in the greatness of the place. Even in the time of Fa-Hien, the city contained "very few inhabitants." The Jetavana was burnt down accidentally and the Purvarama was completely in ruins. In Yuan-Chwang's time, this chief town of Kosala was "desert and ruined" and "there was no record as to its limits." It however survived as a religious centre upto the 12th century, and only after the 13th century does the city seem to have lost its importance as a centre of religion and art.

This book by Dr. Law is certainly a welcome addition to the already rich stock of Buddhist literature, but its usefulness should have been considerably enhanced, if at least some of the monuments of Sravasti had been illustrated in the volume. It is regrettable that this publication of the Archaeological Department, rich in such resources, should altogether

lack a few pictures and plans which would go to illustrate the greatness of this important centre of religion and art

J R A S October 1936 —As in the case of other ancient sites in India, we owe to Alexander Cunningham the identification of the site of the city so famous in the Buddhist literature as Savatthi, with the present Saheth Maheth lying on the boundary between the Gonda and Bahraich districts. This identification was disputed for some time, but it has been fully corroborated by subsequent research. In his introductory chapter Dr Law describes briefly the results of the excavations carried out at the site from the time of Cunningham onwards. The following five sections deal with (1) the origin of the name and topography, (2) Kosala and Sravasti, (3) the Jetavana and Purvarama, (4) Sravasti in religious tradition, (5) the decline of Sravasti, carrying on the story, in which there are wide gaps, down to the twelfth century A D. As the author points out, the prosperity and importance of the town rose and fell with the vicissitudes of the old kingdom of Kosala, which probably attained the zenith of its greatness about the time of the Buddha. When Fa hian went there (early fifth century) the place seems to have been largely in ruin, and Hsuanhsang, who visited it about A D 636, describes the place as "mostly a ruinous waste."

The value of this useful monograph lies chiefly in the labour and care bestowed by Dr Law on the collection and citation of references to the old site and its monuments, as well as to other places in the same region, from the Buddhist texts and from the Brahmanical and Jaina literature.

(Reviewed by C E A W Oldham)

The Times of India February 22 1936 —This little monograph is the fiftieth in the "Memoirs of the Archaeological Survey of India" series and is distinguished by the scholarship characteristic of the publications in this series.

Sravasti was the ancient capital of the Kosala country. It lies on the borders of Gonda and Bahraich districts of

Oudh in the United Provinces; and is one of the eight great places connected with the life of Buddha. Here Buddha performed his great miracle and here, in the monastery of Jetavana, just outside the city, Gautama lived for a number of years.

Dr. Law seeks to recreate the picture of Sravasti as it was. He draws his information mainly from ancient Indian literature—the Brahmanical, Buddhist and Jaina texts and commentaries as revealed in inscriptions on stone and sculpture, unearthed by successive excavations in this area. Cunningham, Benet, Hoey, Vogel and Sir John Marshall, each excavated in this area, and in turn revealed the story of Sravasti in stone. Dr. Law has pieced together the evidence and the picture he presents is at once impressive and fascinating.

Nor is he content to draw for his information on what we may call legitimately, these sources of stone. He goes too to the Mahabharata and the Ramayana, the Matsya and Brahma Puranas and the Pali Jataka commentary to the fountainheads, in fact, of ancient Indian literature.

Dr. Law carries his learning lightly. He holds his reader's attention even while impressing him with his scholarship. This is not quite as easy as it sounds.

Archiv Orientalni, Vol. IX, No. 1/2, 1937: Unter den Städten, die besonders in der buddhistischen Literatur als Zentren des religiösen Geschehens genannt sind, nimmt die Hauptstadt des Kosalareiches, Savatthi, eine solche Stellung ein, daß ihr der Verfasser zahlreiche Werke zur buddhistischen Kultur- und Literaturgeschichte eine Monographie widmen konnte. Hier findet man alles zusammengestellt, was für die Etymologie des Namens, für die Lage, die epigraphischen Belege, Anlage, Bauten, religiösen und weltlichen Persönlichkeiten der Stadt aus der buddhistischen, jainistischen und brahmanischen Literatur und den chinesischen Reiseberichten zu entnehmen ist. Der Verfasser geht an seine Aufgabe vom historiographischen

Gesichtspunkt, daher kann man nicht gut ein Eingehen auf die höchst bedeutsame Plastik von Saheth Maheth, dem heutigen Namen der antiken Siedlung, fordern, wiewohl auch Dr Law (S 3) von den Terrakotten „of special interest from both artistic and historical points of view“ spricht. Zur Vervollständigung der Literatur über Sravasti, dem der moderne Teil Maheth entspricht, während das Jetavana auf dem Boden von Saheth anzusetzen ist, waren V A Smiths Aufsätze im JRAS 1898, 502ff, 1900, 1 ff zu nennen, der sich selbst in der Early History of India (4th ed, 31, 2) nicht mit der Identifikation befreunden konnte. ferner der Artikel Sravasti in Deys Geogr Dict² 189 f. Aus der Lebensgeschichte des Buddha fehlt die Cinca Episode. Vielleicht bereichert der Verfasser die Forschung durch weitere Monographien über bedeutende Städte Altindiens, in welchem Falle jedoch eine Karte, Lageplan und einige archäologischen Tafeln erforderlich wären.

O Stein

Quarterly Journal of the Mythic Society Vol XXVI New Series Nos 3 & 4 January—April 1936 —Sravasti, the ancient Kosala capital, is one of the eight great places connected with Buddha's life and specially venerated by Buddhists all over the world. It was the scene of the Great Miracle and the Jetavana monastery outside the city was for a number of years hallowed by the presence of the master. Besides, sermons and sayings attributed to him were mostly delivered here according to the sacred books. Anything concerning this holy site will be of special interest and Dr Law gives us in this Memoir an account of the place collected from the Brahmanical, Buddhist and Jaina texts and commentaries and from scattered accounts left by celebrated Chinese Pilgrims. Two early inscriptions belonging to the periods contemporaneous with Kanishka or Huvishka refer to the pious donations of Bhikshu Bala. Sculptures of all the three schools are found. The place lost its importance after the thirteenth century as a centre of art and religion. The most prosperous in Buddha's time, its

general prosperity was bound up with that of Kosala itself. It is also noted as the birth-place of the third Jaina Tirthankara Sambhavanatha and the eighth Chandraprabhanatha Mahavira visited the city more than once. Vedic sacrifices were also regularly performed here under the auspices of the Kosala King. With all this, it must be observed that the whole city was surcharged with the influence of Buddha and Buddhism, and it continued to be a most important Buddhist centre linking up with it the vicissitudes of a great religion for eighteen hundred years.

RAJAGRIHA IN ANCIENT LITERATURE

Contents *Different names their origin and significance — General description and topography — Antiquity and history of Rajagriha — Antiquity and location of five hills — Rajagriha in religious history — Architecture of Rajagriha*

Dr Johnston —Excellent memoir on Rajagriha It puts the known information about it together in a most convenient way

Dr Barnett —An admirable piece of scholarly workmanship

Sir Edward Maclagan — * * * valuable work I have found it exceedingly interesting and venture to express my admiration of the erudition and scholarship which have gone to its making You had a very attractive subject to deal with and what you seem to have given is the last word on all that is to be said about it

Mrs Rhys Davids —Handsome study of *Rajagriha*

Dr Otto Stein —You have to be congratulated for the enterprise with which you have taken up the topography of renowned cities in Ancient India in monographs By collecting every detail about the town Rajagriha after your monograph on *Sravasti* you have contributed a new chapter to the work which I presume will be continued by your indefatigable enthusiasm for the Geography and History of Ancient India

Dr W Geiger — * * * valuable present Such detailed studies of Indian history and topography as your admirable monograph on Rajagriha are indeed urgently needed, and they are an excellent help to all who are engaged in Indological research, chiefly to the European scholars who are so far away from that wonderful country which is so rich in historical reminiscences

Dr E. J. Thomas: ' ' ' valuable work on Rajagriha in ancient literature. It contains a great amount of interesting information which will be of great importance to investigators and it will take some time to digest it all

Amrita Bazar Patrika, 29th January 1939: The monograph gives systematic account of Rajagriha, which seems, for the present, exhaustive. The work is based on all the available literary sources, Brahmanical, Jaina and Buddhist. The origin and significance of the different names of Rajagriha, its topography and antiquity, Rajagriha in religious history and the secular and religious architecture of Rajagriha are the topics discussed in the volume.

The four plates appended to the book are the photographs reprinted, of

- (a) Sonagiri with the cyclopean wall on it, as seen from Udaigiri,
- (b) Pippala stone house or Jarasandh-ka-baithak,
- (c) New Rajgir, South Gate of Fort,
- (d) Maniyar Math; Fragmentary red sand-stone sculpture as reconstructed

Oriental Literary Digest, 1939, No. 9: Any one who cares to investigate the ancient history of any country in the world realizes the necessity of having by his side authoritative reference books on the ancient geography of that country, not to say that of the adjacent countries in contact with it. In fact there can be no true history without an accurate geographical perspective to help its reconstruction. Many an expert in historiography is sometimes guilty of wrong identification of place-names leading to wrong reconstruction of history, which otherwise may be perfect in every respect. To remedy this defect a systematic collection, record and interpretation of geographical data from all known sources is the *sine qua non* of historical studies worth the name. We are, therefore, glad to find an eminent scholar of Dr. Law's reputation undertaking

this laborious task in a spirit of service to the cause of our ancient culture and executing it with a thoroughness and comprehension rarely met with in such studies

We have had occasion to notice Dr LAW's *Geographical Essays*, Vol I, sometimes ago (OLD, August 1938) Such studies must precede the compilation of an authoritative *Geographical Dictionary* of ancient Indian place names We have, therefore, great pleasure to notice Dr LAW's monograph on *Rajagriha in Ancient Literature*, which has found an honoured place in the *Memoirs of the Archaeological Survey of India* In this monograph an attempt has been made by the learned author to give us an exhaustive and systematic account of Rajagriha from all available literary sources, Brahmanical, Jaina and Buddhist, which coupled with the map of Rajagriha already published in the *Archæological Report* for 1905-06 brings out in full historical relief this hallowed place so rich in historical and religious associations The monograph is divided into six chapters, (1) Different names of Rajagriha, their origin and significance (pp 1-2), (2) General Description and Topography (pp 2-20), (3) Antiquity and History of Rajagriha (pp 21-28), (4) Antiquity and Location of the Five Hills (pp 28-33), (5) Rajagriha in Religious History (pp 33-42) and (6) Architecture of Rajagriha, Secular and Religious (pp 42-44) These chapters are followed by an Index (pp 45-49) and plates illustrating Sonagiri with the cyclopean wall on it as seen from Udayagiri, Pippal stone house of Jarasandha Ka Buthak, South Gate of Fort of New Rajgir and Rajagriha Maniyar Math with its red sand stone sculpture as reconstructed

The political history of Rajagriha and Magadha shows that the city of Rajagriha was at the height of its prosperity during the reign of Bimbisara and Ajatasatru Later when Fa Hien visited the place in the 5th century A.D. he found emptiness and desolation inside the city and at the time of Hwen Thsang's visit in the 7th century A.D. the only inhabitants of the city

were 1000 Brahmin families besides the Digambaras lodging in the *Vaibhara* mountain and practising austerities incessantly. The hot springs of Rajagriha survive even to this day. *Tapoda* is mentioned by Buddhist writers as a hot river while the *Mahabharata* mentions *Tapodah* as denoting hot spring in the neighbourhood of Rajagriha. *Tapodarama* was a retreat for the Buddhist monks near about the hot springs, but this retreat was completely forgotten when the Chinese pilgrims visited Rajagriha though according to the *Mahaparinibbanasuttana* Lord Buddha "dwelt in Rajagaha in the retreat called Tapodarama." Though the *dharma* was publicly proclaimed at Benares the influence of Buddhism really spread from Rajagriha (p 40). The shady slopes and caverns of the hills around Rajagriha were used as places for meditation by the *bhiksus* and *bhiksunis* even in the very life-time of Buddha. It is difficult in this short notice to indicate the importance of the geographical and historical data recorded in this monograph about Rajagriha, the birth-place of Buddhism. If Lord Buddha praised the sombre beauty of Rajagriha with its hills and retreats with the words "Delightful, Ananda, is Rajagriha" we have no hesitation to say "Delightful is *Rajagriha in Ancient Literature*." The method adopted by Dr Law in the presentation of his material in this monograph is well worth application to similar studies with reference to many other historic places in India.

P. K. Gode

XI

A HISTORY OF PALI LITERATURE

Contents *Vol I — Chronology of the Pali Canon — Canonical Pali Literature Vinaya Sutta and Abhidhamma Pitakas — Pali counterparts of the seven Abhidhamma treatises of the Sarvastivada School*
Vol II — Extra Canonical Works presupposed by Pali Commentaries — Pali Commentaries — Pali Chronicles — Pali Manuals — Pali Literary pieces — Pali grammars lexicographies and works of prosody etc

Dr Rouse —A book which will meet a great want among scholars

Dr Barnett —It is an excellent work of careful scholarship and I have already proved its utility

Prof E J Rapson —Most valuable and interesting history of Pali Literature which I value very highly and which I shall very often consult * * * I congratulate you sincerely on the work which will take its place as the standard book of reference on its subject

Mon L Finot —Important and interesting book It seems to me extremely well devised to provide the tillers in the Buddhakshetra with an invaluable stock of information and references You have worked hard for this result and undoubtedly you will reap in return much punya with the gratitude of the whole panditajana

Dr E J Thomas —It is a work that needed doing and it is a great advantage not only to have the whole material surveyed but also embraced in one comprehensive book I have a history of Buddhist Thought in the press and I was able to mention that your work was forthcoming but could not unfortunately give details I am glad to see that in treating of Abhidhamma

you have clearly distinguished what is in the text from what is in the commentary specially in the case of Kathavatthu

Dr M. Nagai: Valuable work

Sir E Denison Ross: It is a work of which you may indeed feel proud. It is obviously a great achievement and produced in a form worthy of the subject

Dr. Otto Stein: Your grand book on Buddhist literature, it is a huge work which deserves thanks not only of Buddhalogists but also of wider circles interested in that field of research

Dr. F O Schrader: This book is sure to be used as the standard work on the subject for many years to come. I am bound to say that it is immensely practical and full of valuable information. Your book is just the one required for giving the students a new impulse and showing them how many problems there remain to be solved in this field

Dr Sten Konow: It is a most welcome and valuable work which you have given us and the full account of the contents of the various Pali works makes it possible to use your treatise as an index. Conscientious and careful compilations as the present one are extremely useful and again you have laid your fellow-workers under a deep obligation.

Lord Zetland: I feel sure that the work should prove to be of deep interest and of real value to all scholars who have worked in the field of Buddhism

Prof Louis de la Vallee Poussin. Important book, a lot of information on most interesting topics. I hope to publish a review

Lord Chalmers: Notable present hope to profit by perusing them.

Mon J Przyluski — * * * This much needed work fills a gap in our knowledge and will be welcomed by all who are interested in the study of Buddhism and of middle Indo Aryan

Dr M Walleser — * * * extremely interesting book * * * very clever analysis of so huge a mass of literature, and I think that many people will be glad and thankful at having now an easy access to the somewhat bewildering study of Abhidhamma text and others of similar kind. I hope you will be rewarded for the fatigues and the time you have spent with this work, by a vast circle of readers, and the rather popular style of the work will surely contribute to this end

Dr M Winternitz — * * * very useful, especially as an introduction to Pāli literature for such students of Indology who have hitherto paid no attention to Buddhist literature * * * I shall write a review of it

Dr A V Williams Jackson — Your work is sure to be of great value to all who are interested in the literature of Buddhism. I am particularly glad that you have given so much space to the post Canonical Pāli writings, many of which are little known or studied in the West

Dr R C Majumdar — * * * a very valuable work and the most comprehensive history of the Pāli Literature. It will remove a long felt want and prove a great blessing to all students of ancient Indian History and Civilisation. The work will be a great monument to your industry and scholarship

Mr S Paranavitana — * * * You have made a survey of almost the whole range of the vast Pāli literature and given the reader an adequate idea not only of its historical development but also of the contents of the more important texts. This last feature, I am sure, will be much appreciated by those who are unable to read the original Pāli texts. Your work is an indispensable one alike to the student and to the scholar and

by it you have placed all those interested in the study of Pali under a deep obligation to you.

Dr. Ganganath Jha: I suppose it is for the first time that we have before us a complete account of an important literature. By writing this comprehensive history, you have increased to a great extent the debt the world of scholars has owed you for your works.

Bhikkhu Narada: The Buddhist world has been placed under a deep debt of gratitude to Dr. B. C. Law for his excellent treatise. It is an admirable and successful general survey of Canonical and non-Canonical Pali Literature. This voluminous work of Dr. Law may be treated as the most comprehensive and the most valuable contribution hitherto published in Buddhist literature, particularly because the author has taken immense pains to give in brief the contents of the whole Tipitaka and the necessary information about other Pali books.

The Buddhist, September 1933: * * * Volume I opens with an introduction taken up largely with a summary of different views held by scholars of repute regarding the home of Pali. * * *

Chapter I on the chronology of the Pali Canon is one of the best portions of the book. Many attempts to give a relative chronology of the Canonical texts have been made since Rhys Davids' tentative account in his *Buddhist India*. * * * Dr. Law proceeds to give his findings, towards which he has brought under contribution the ripe judgments expressed by numerous editors of texts and authors of various articles and books dealing with the subject. It is not to be expected that his views will gain universal acceptance, but they are certainly suggestive and well-informed and are characterised by scholarly sobriety and impartiality. Nearly 300 pages are taken up with ample and clear summaries of the contents of the Tipitaka, some of them exhaustive * * * of great value for reference and particularly useful for those who cannot read

them in the original * * * The last chapter of volume I is a comparative account of the Pali counterparts of the seven Abhidhamma treatises of the Sarvastivada school * * * * * immense value of his voluminous work which will undoubtedly form a *vade mecum* for all students of this branch of learning Dr Law has already won many laurels, his latest achievement will enhance his reputation, even now so great * * * Dr Geiger contributes a short but characteristically suggestive Foreword

Amrita Bazar Patrika dated 3rd September 1933 —The author is one of the most active workers in the field of Pali literature He has already published several volumes of studies on different aspects of the Pali Buddhist Literature during the last few years The two present volumes constitute his latest contribution on the subject

In the introduction of the book the author has tackled the knotty problem of the Origin and Home of Pali and the first chapter has been devoted to the discussion of the chronology of the Pali texts He has tried to establish a new chronology of the Pali texts according to his own ideas about them Chap 2 is entirely devoted to the consideration of the canonical portion of the Pali literature that is to say of the 'Tripiṭaka par excellence' consisting of the Sutta, 'Vinaya and Abhidhamma The third chapter deals with the Pali counterparts of the Abhidhammas of the Sarvastivada school whereas Chaps IV to IX are devoted to the treatment of the extra canonical literature the Pali chronicles like the Dīpavamsa and the Mahāvamsa the manuals, literary pieces, etc

The book is a sort of running survey of the whole field of Pali literature The titles of almost all the texts, both canonical and non canonical, have been mentioned and in many cases short summaries of these texts have been given The book as such will be very useful to those who want to

get a complete idea of the Pali Buddhist literature. The author should be congratulated for having brought out these volumes

The Maha-Bodhi, December 1933: Dr Bimala Churn Law's new publication, *History of Pali Literature* in two volumes, is a welcome addition to the type of books, which is most in want in India. Scholars generally will also find it profitable to give these compendious volumes more than a cursory glance, and utilize the author's help in compiling a fairly exhaustive bibliography on the subject. Dr Law is well aware of the fact that for the success of his undertaking he is indebted to a host of scholars who by their researches have greatly facilitated modern studies in Pali Literature, Winternitz, Rhys Davids, Geiger, Kern, to mention only a few out of many. Most of the important Pali texts have already been edited. The task of writing a history of Pali Literature has thus become much easier recently than several years ago and it was certainly a happy idea that occurred to Dr Law to execute it with the ability to which his work bears undoubted testimony. * * * Nothing however, can detract from the merit of the performance as a whole. Here in these two volumes readers will find ample materials put together in a convenient manner, that may be expected to suggest new lines of research to enquiring minds. The very wide scope covered by the author may be indicated in the following outline. Chapter I is an attempt to settle the chronology of the Pali Canon. The author differing from Rhys Davids in important respects presents a chronological table on page 42 which is based on a closer examination of the texts. Chapter II deals with Canonical Pali Literature. Dr Law follows the classification already adopted in the preceding chapter and explains every text with reference to its contents. Chapter III with which Vol. I closes is entitled 'Pali Counterparts of the Seven Abhidhamma Treatises of the Saivastivada School,' which are preserved in Chinese translations. Chapter IV with which

Vol II opens gives an account of 'Extra Canonical Works presupposed by Pāli Commentaries,' which includes such texts as the Nettipakarana, Petakopadesa, Milinda Panha, etc. The next Chapter V deals with Pāli Commentaries, *viz*, the works of Buddhadatta, Buddhaghosa and Dhammapala. Chapter VI is devoted to a treatment of the Pāli Chronicles, the Dīpavamsa and the Mahāvamsa. Another Chapter (VII) introduces the reader to Pāli manuals, beginning from the Saccasamkhepa of doubtful authorship and then passing to the Abhidhammatthasangaha, a philosophical treatise of considerable importance, and a few other small tracts. Chapter VIII is devoted to Pāli literary pieces by which are meant seven metrical compositions, the Anagatavamsa, the Jinacarita, etc., which are classified as productions of Ceylon. Chapter IX furnishes a short account of Pāli grammars, lexicographies and works on Prosody, etc. The author next sums up briefly some interesting features of the literature discussed in greater detail in the preceding chapters. Two appendices have been added. Appendix A is devoted to a concise classification of historical and geographical references in the Pāli Pitakas. Appendix B is an attempt mainly to restore Pāli Texts in inscriptions from India and Burma. * * * Even a mere glance at the contents of the two volumes before us, however, cannot but convince the sympathetic reader of the magnitude of the work carried out by the author. Dr Law may well be proud of the valuable service he has rendered towards the edification of his own countrymen as well as those interested in Asiatic culture and thought. It is a book that will repay careful reading.

Buddhism in England Jan Feb, 1934 — * * * it is indeed veritably encyclopædic in its range, dealing in detail with every work in Pāli literature discussing its subject matter, its history, date, authorship, etc. The first volume deals with the origin of the Pāli language, and how it acquired its name, with the chronology of the Pāli Canon, and with the Abhi

dhamma literature of the Sarvastivada School and its relation-ship to that of the canonical Pitaka. A brief outline of the subject-matter of each book is given. The critical comments of Dr. Law are a valuable feature of the work. We quote, as an interesting example, his opinion regarding the statement that the Buddha asserted that the Dhamma must be taught only in the Magadhi idiom. He tells us that Buddhaghosa's interpretation of 'the passage in *Cullavagga* V 33 is quite wrong, that the Buddha would never have been guilty of a micchaditthi of the kind, and that what he actually said was, that "avoiding a language which has become dead, archaic and obsolete, one should use with advantage a vehicle of expression with which one is really conversant." One would think this view point would appeal to every sensible person, and yet we have had objections (presumably originating from a misunderstanding of this passage) to translating the Dhamma into Western idioms and expressing it in Western modes of thought. As an example of the thoroughness of treatment, we would mention that Dr. Law devotes 26 pages to the Dhammapada. . . . Ten pages are devoted to the Jatakas, with some very wise comments concerning them and their value as literature, as history, and as moral instruction. . . . The second volume is devoted to post-canonical literature. Here we have an equally exhaustive treatment of the Commentaries, of the Chronicles, such as Dipavamsa and the Mahavamsa (with much valuable geographical information concerning them), the Dathavamsa, etc., of the instruction manuals and literary writings and of the Pali Grammars. The whole work is summed up in a concluding chapter of half-a-dozen pages and some useful geographical appendices complete it. Dr. Law is to be congratulated on his painstaking work. It fills a long-needed want, and it has been admirably accomplished.

J. R. A. S : The scope of the work is a presentation of the Buddhist Pali Literature in contents, arrangement, chronology, general

history, textual criticism, style, language and importance. Dr Law has divided it into two parts—Canonical and post Canonical literature. Several chapters had already appeared in the course of the last few years in separate publications. Of these the best is undoubtedly the chapter on Chronology (pp 1-12). * * * Dr Law's book will be a great help to the student of the Canon, in giving him a complete review of the Pitrakas.

Journal of Indian History December 1934.—The need of a detailed and systematic history of the Pali Literature which was felt for a long time by scholars interested in Buddhism, has been met by the two volumes of Dr B. C. Law, under review. The importance, value and usefulness of such a work can hardly be exaggerated. Fully realising the laboriousness of the task involved and the mastery of Pali indicated, we heartily congratulate Dr Bimala Churn on the splendid success of his great undertaking. In the Introduction to Vol. I of the work Dr Law discusses with great ability the origin of the Pali language followed by an equally important discussion, in Chapter I, on the relative Chronology of the canonical texts, making a great advance upon what the late lamented Khys Davids has said on the subject in his *Buddhist India* (p. 188).

The whole of the First Volume is devoted to a careful examination of the canonical Pali Literature which consists of three Pitrakas—Vinaya Pitaka, Sutta Pitaka and Abhidhamma Pitaka. Under the Vinaya Pitaka we have lucid summaries of the four books—Suttavibhanga, Khuddhaka, Parivara and Patimokkha. Into the detail of these we cannot enter, but we invite the attention of the reader to pages 73-78 where a summary of the rules affecting the bhikkhus or women mendicants, and of the conditions on which they entered the Order is furnished. From the Buddha's prediction given on p. 77 it would appear that the admittance of women into the Order had not the full approval of the Founder of Buddhism.

The Sutta Pitaka is divided into five Nikayas, Digha Nikaya, Majjhima Nikaya, Samyutta Nikaya, Anguttara

Nikaya and Khuddaka Nikaya Every one of them is analysed and a useful summary of the matter contained in it is given. These five nikayas are very important books for a correct study of Buddhism They also contain incidentally very valuable information for the reconstruction of the social history of the age. To cite a few instances, the Brahmajala Sutta of the Dīgha-nikaya treats of omens, dreams, charms and spells, thus showing its indebtedness to the Atharva Veda; the Samannaphala sutta furnishes us with a list of ordinary occupations, like those of barbers, washermen, weavers, the Kutadanta sutta refers to the kings, nobles, lokayata, etc., while the Mahagovinda sutta to the path leading to Nirvana, and Singalovada sutta to the laymen Again in the Mahadukkhakkhanda sutta of Majjhima nikaya we have a list of offences punishable by the penal laws of Ancient India, and the different kinds of professions that suited the householder In the Tevijja-Vaccagotta sutta Buddha criticises the Ajivakas, and in the Devadaha sutta the doctrine of the Niganthas is characterised as fatuous To take a sutta at random from the Anguttara, the Navaka Nipata speaks of the attainment of ahatship, and incidentally of the five destinies of beings In the Dhammapada again Brahmana vagga defines a true Brahman The Sutta Nipata shows Buddhism essentially as an ethical system, its goal being Nirvana In this work traces of primitive Buddhism are found Passing on to the Kathavattu, Dr Law agrees with the view that it was the work of Moggalliputta Tissa, President of the Third Council under the patronage of Asoka (see also p. 526) But the very existence of this Council is a fact yet to be proved The remark that is if definitely settled that Asoka was a Buddhist from the doubtful and mostly unidentified passages of the Bhabru Edict may prove an overstatement

The second volume is as valuable as the first. A chapter is devoted to extra canonical matters presupposed by the Pali commentaries. Of these the Netti or Nettipakarana is a treatise

on the textual and exegetical methodology, in other words, the tantra yuktis described in the Arthasastra and the Tamil Grammar, Tolkappiyam. The next important work is Milinda Panha which is a Pali translation of the original text, perhaps in Sanskrit. Milinda, identified with Menander, the Bactrian King in the Punjab, is the King of the Yonas with his capital at Sialkot, of the 2nd Century B.C. It was a discourse between this king and an Arhat on the disputed doctrines of the Buddha. Chapter V is on Pali commentaries and commentators like the Buddhādatta, Buddhaghosa and Dhammapala. Both Datta and Ghosa were contemporaries. Buddhādatta is said to have been born in modern Ururur, in the Trichinopoly District, and flourished during the reign of the Kadamba or Kalamba King Acyuta Virarata, a contemporary of Kumara Gupta I. As for Buddhaghosa he is said to have visited Ceylon during the reign of Mahavamsa in the first half of the fifth century A.D. Dhammapala was again a Tamilan, a native of Conjeevaram. Among the commentaries mention may be made of Sumangalavilasini on the Digha Nikaya. It contains some historical details. It traces the origin of the Sakyas to Ikshvaku, and gives materials for the reigns of Bimbisara and Ajatasattu. The legends of the princes are also referred to in the Dhammapala commentary (p. 457). This also gives details with regard to marriage of daughters of Kings and nobles. Among the works of Dhammapala, the Vimanavatthu commentary throws light on the Buddhist perspective of Heaven and Hell. It is tempting to find an origin of the Tamil work Kundalakesi with Buddha Kundalakesi in the Theragatha commentary written by Dhammapala.

The next chapter deals with Pali chronicles—the Dipavamsa and Mahavamsa of Ceylon. As these are well known works often quoted by scholars it is not necessary to refer to them at length. Suffice it to say that these chronicles contain some authentic historical tradition. The Culavamsa is a continuation of the Mahavamsa, written in the 6th century A.D.

It is divided into three sections dealing with 78, 23 and 24 kings respectively. The minor chronicles of which a large number are given we propose passing over. Two chapters, VII and VIII are devoted to an examination of Pali manuals and Pali literary pieces. The last chapter is on Pali grammars, lexicons, works on prosody, etc. It is certainly curious how a literature developed without the development side by side of grammar and lexicon. It seems to us that we could not ignore the tradition of Kaccayana being a contemporary of the Buddha, and if this tradition were accepted the Pali grammar must be dated 5th century B C. If the lower limit to Panini's date be accepted with Belvalkar as the 7th century B C there is nothing unreasonable in assigning Kaccayana to the 5th century B C. There are two useful appendices and an index. In judgment sober and in exposition clear, Dr Law's book is a sound piece of work, and its usefulness to all students of Ancient India can hardly be exaggerated.

(Reviewed by Mr V R R Dikshitar)

The Hindustan Review, 19th July 1934: A very warm welcome should be extended to Mr Bimala Churn Law's *History of Pali Literature*. Though special monographs were in existence dealing with the Pali literatures of Ceylon and Burma, the work under notice is the first, comprehensive, general historical sketch of Pali literature. But it is not to be welcomed solely on the ground of its being a pioneer work on the subject it deals with. Its merits are truly of a high order, and it would have done credit to any savant either in the East or the West. The treatment is scientific, the conclusions set forth are based on research, the writer has brought to bear upon the discussion a critical acumen of no mean order, and the result is a standard work which will hold its own for yet a long time to come. It will not only enhance the author's reputation as a scholar, but will redound to the credit of Indian scholarship and spirit of research. It covers the whole ground, is lucid in its statements, accurate in its data, and sound in its

conclusions. As such it is a truly monumental work, and merits appreciation.

Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona
Vol. XV Parts I II 1934 —Those who are familiar with the many works on Buddhism which have come from Dr. Bimala Churn Law's ready pen will find in his latest work abundant evidence of his wide reading and intimate knowledge of the Pali literature. The work, which was approved by the University of Calcutta for the Griffith Memorial Prize in Letters in 1931, is unquestionably wanted, for in scope it transcends the works of Dr. Bode and Dr. Malalasekera on the Pali literature in Burma and Ceylon, and in wealth of detail it goes far beyond even Professor Winternitz's masterly sketch, which is to be made available in English. The two works, written from different standpoints, will be found admirably to supplement each other, and to facilitate the further investigation of the manifold problems of literary history presented by the abundant Pali literature. Dr. Law is well aware how much there still remains to be done on the field in which he labours, and doubtless we may expect much further enlightenment at his hands. It is an interesting suggestion (ii 646) that Pali literature has still great possibilities of influence on the literature of the east and west alike, and that both modern and ancient Bengalee literature have drawn inspiration from Pali literature.

The careful analysis of the contents of the important works dealt with is a feature of special value, and it is to be regretted that the index has not been extended so as to make available more readily the wealth of facts recorded. Dr. Law is on the whole more concerned with the matter than the form of the literature, and neither the *Theragatha* nor the *Therīgatha* arouses in him the admiration which others have felt for these texts. But he is more appreciative of the *Jinacarita*, and while not contesting the acquaintance of its author with the classical Sanskrit literature points out (ii 614)

that the style of poetry found in the works of Asvaghosa or the *Kumarasambhava* of Kalidasa leads us back to the gathas forming the prologue of the Nalakasutta in the *Suttanipata* as its model. On other points, perhaps unfortunately, he leaves us without assurance of his own views. Thus he cites (i 276) the views of Professor Rhys Davids (*Buddhist India*, pp. 180-6, 205, 206) on the origin of the Jatakas in such a way as to suggest that he accepts the view held by that scholar, with Oldenberg and Windisch, of the Akhyana in verse and prose as the precursor of epic. It would unquestionably have been of value to have this subject considered once more by an expert from the standpoint of the Buddhist literature, when in all probability the theory would have been seen to present at least as many problems as it solves.

It is natural to turn to Dr. Law's view (Introduction, pp. IXXXV) of the linguistic character of Pali. Dr. Law adopts a view of the famous passage of the Vinaya on *saka nirutti* which denies it any linguistic reference. He holds that it means "a mode of expression which a member of the Holy Order might claim as his own, that is to say, an idiom, a diction, a language or a vehicle of expression with which a Bhikkhu was conversant, which a person could use with advantage, a mode of expression which was not Buddha's own but which might be regarded as one by the Bhikkhus representing diverse names, cultures, races, and families. One's mother tongue or vernacular would also be an interpretation of *saka nirutti* inconsistent with the context as well as with the Buddha's spirit of rationalist." It is not easy to accept this view as cogent. It is, of course, true that the term *saka nirutti* cannot possibly mean the speech of the Buddha, assumed by Buddhaghosa to be Magadhi, but, as the alternative is *Chandaso*, it seems impossible not to give the term a definite reference to language, and we may permit the Buddha to have the honour of having encouraged the use of the vernacular for his gospel. That, it seems to me, accords well with his

rationalism for a version of his tenets *chandaso* would hardly have helped the diffusion of his doctrine. We can, however, only agree with Dr. Law in leaving open the issue of the dialect on which Pali is based. It is so literary a language when it is recorded that any particularisation runs serious risk of exceeding what is legitimate in the way of speculation.

Attention should also be called to Dr. Law's elaborate investigation (i 142) of the chronology of the Pali canonical texts, which contains much of interest and importance. It must, however, remain doubtful what value is to be attached to the theory (i 324,325) which ascribes the *Kathavatthu* to the period of Asoka, and all conclusions which assume the truth of that ascription suffer from the dubiety of its accuracy. Similarly the *Dhammasangani*, which Mrs. Rhys Davids ascribes to the fourth century B.C. may well be very considerably later in date. It is unlucky that conclusive evidence of any sort in these matters is still lacking. The collection of data by the author is most valuable, but in nearly every case nothing but relative chronology can be regarded as attained, and in many instances even this is lacking. It is still not proved that Asoka knew any of our texts in anything like their present form.

Our sincere thanks are due to the author for his two Appendices the first on the historical and geographical data of the Pitakas, and the second on the Pali tracts in inscriptions.

A. Berriedale Keith

Archiv Orientalni VII 1935 —This is the most comprehensive treatment of Pali literature that has so far been published. In its two volumes this new work of Dr. B. C. Law to whom we already owe a great number of useful books, contains all the information that is wanted about this most important branch of Buddhist literature, the first volume dealing with the Pali canon, the second with the non canonical texts, including the earlier books (*Netti*, *Petakopadesa*, *Milindapanha*), the commentaries, the chronicles, manuals, some later works of literary

merit, grammars, lexicons, and works on prosody. The last chapter of Vol. I gives an account of the Pali counterparts of the seven Abhidhamma treatises of the Sarvastivada School. Two extremely useful Appendices (Appendix A. Historical and Geographical References in the Pali Pitakas, Appendix B. Pali Tracts in the Inscriptions) are found at the end of Vol. II.

The vexed question of the origin and home of Pali is treated in the Introduction. After discussing the divergent views on the question, author suggests (p. XXV) "that Pali is based on a western form of the Indian Prakritic dialects particularly the form which tallied with the dialect of the Girnar version of Asoka's Rock Edicts and to some extent with the Sauraseni prakrit as known to the grammarians." But he admits that the question cannot be definitely settled. He returns to the subject again, when speaking of the Sutta Nipata (p. 258 ff), where he shows that four different strata are to be distinguished in the development of Pali.

The first chapter is devoted to the chronology of the Pali Canon. Here the author tries to fix, as far as this is possible, the date of each book of the canon, and to establish a chronological sequence in the evolution of the canon from the time of the Buddha down to the second century B.C. This discussion throws no doubt a good deal of new light on the highly involved problem of the relative chronology of the canonical texts. Yet I must say that the results arrived at by the author, as they are presented in the table on p. 42, can at best only be taken *cum grano salis*. The fact is, nearly all the books of the canons are collections, and every one of them contains both earlier and later texts. Dr. Law takes it for granted that the Kathavatthu is "undoubtedly a work of the Asokan age" (p. 324). This view is not generally accepted. Some scholars have entirely rejected the tradition according to which Tissa Moggaliputta, the president of the Third Council, compiled the Kathavatthu. I myself am inclined to accept the

tradition and consider it possible that such a work was compiled in the third century B C But we know that the Kathavatthu in its present form is a patch work, and additions were made at different times (See my History of Indian Literature, II, 1933, p 169 f) Dr Law also relies much on the Milindapanha which quotes many texts from the canon, taking it for granted, that it is a work of the first or second century A D But he does not mention that this date can be accepted for the earlier part of the work only (books I—III), not for books IV—VII which are not found in the Chinese translation, made between 317 and 420 A D (See my Hist of Ind Lit II, 176 f) * * *

In spite of such differences of opinion in details, I have great pleasure in acknowledging the great usefulness of Dr Law's work Its special feature is that it gives very extensive summaries of all the important canonical and post canonical Pali texts As some of these have hitherto been little known, even students of Buddhism will find much useful information in the two volumes But the work will be especially welcome to students of Indian culture and religions who are not able to read the sacred books of Buddhism in the original language, but wish to become acquainted with their general contents To many an Indian student the perusal of Dr Law's work may also prove an incitement to begin the study of Pali which up to now has been too much neglected in India

M Winternitz

The Indian Review December 1934 —We agree with Dr Geiger that "there can be no doubt that a new and ample treatment of the Pali Literature is a great scientific want felt by all the scholars who are working in that field Sanskritic studies, both in India and abroad, have been generally handicapped by the absence of such a treatment The history of Sanskrit Literature from Panini to the fourth century A D cannot be accurately described if the history of the development of Pali Literature during the same period also is not pressed into service Sanskritic studies in Indian universities are

seriously handicapped on account of the absence of facilities for the study of Pali and its Literature even at the preliminary stages Dr. Law has admirably summed up the importance of the study of Pali in the following words .

“The study of Pali is essential for the reconstruction of the history of Ancient India Pali Literature is vast and rich in materials which render an invaluable aid to the systematic study of ancient Indian history. ” The Pali Commentaries furnish us with a great store-house of valuable information regarding the literary, linguistic, social, economic, political, architectural and religious history of Ancient India

To a student of the Ancient History of India, the study of Pali is as important as that of Sanskrit and the Prakrits, and in a sense more important as furnishing reliable data on Chronology ”

We therefore congratulate Dr Law on the splendid achievement in presenting the history of Pali Literature in two volumes, characterised by thoroughness of research and broad outlook on the many intricate problems connected with the Pali Language and Literature an achievement which is doubly welcome as this is the first occasion that an Indian of outstanding eminence has brought out an authoritative exposition of the studies that have been engaging the serious attention of European scholars for over two centuries now.

XII

A STUDY OF THE MAHAVASTU &

Supplement to the same

Contents *Buddhas and Bodhisattvas — Gautama the Buddha — Stories — Jataka and Avadana contrasted — Importance of the study of the text — Religion and philosophy — Language and Literature — The legend of the Buddha — Date of the Mahavastu — Jatakas — Stray incidents from Buddha's life — The story of the origin of Kingship*

Dr E W Hopkins — You have performed *a useful deed in reducing the confused mass of the Mahavastu to a comprehensive shape*. It always seemed to me the most incoherent medley that the formless literature gathered in the wake of Buddha has produced and I am glad to get so agreeable a bird's eye view as you provide in your shortened version. The value of the work in its original condition does not seem to me to be very great but if it offers nothing new philosophically, it has historical importance specially as indicating the growth and variability of the Jataka stories as you have printed out.

Sir George Grierson — It is a *most interesting work*, and will be very useful to me, *greatly helping the reading of the original*.

Prof Louis de la Vallee Poussin — You have added a new volume to the series which you are editing of works which are at the same time *both learned and easy to read*. * * * It is forty years ago when as a young student I read that text with Kern which is a glorious name in Indology. And since then I have had pleasure frequently *to glance through enormous mass of Buddhist folklore and anecdotes*. I bring all this in to tell you that I am sufficiently well placed to appreciate the troubles that you have taken to make known all that this book so richly

offers and where one misses one's way so easily. I am preparing a short note for the *Bibliographie Bouddhique*.

Dr. M. Winternitz: ' ' ' your *very useful study of the Mahavastu*. It is an important work of the transition period between Hinayana and Mahayana.

Dr M. Walleser: ' ' ' Your interesting study of the Mahavastu which means a remarkable step towards a better understanding of the text. It is really astonishing that you contrive to accomplish your scientific work in such a manner

Dr. L. D. Barnett: It will be *very helpful* as a guide to the student through the wilderness of the original text

Prof. E. J. Rapson: ' ' ' I congratulate you on your patience in analysing this encyclopædia of Buddhist lore and your skill in making such an interesting selection from its contents

Mon L. Finot: It is a very useful and welcomed book which makes easier to many students the approach of so rich a store but with a rather forbidding access as is the Mahavastu. You have no doubt in writing it heaped up a vast amount of punya

Dr Hermann Jacobi: ' ' ' All students of Buddhism will be glad to use your guide in the bewildering contents of that important text

Dr A B Keith. I have read with pleasure your summaries of the material of the work and I congratulate you on one more addition to the many contributions which you have made to our knowledge of Buddhist tradition. I hope that your book will have the same favourable reception as has fallen to the lot of your earlier treatises.

Dr W Geiger: ' ' ' very valuable study of the Mahavastu. You have again chosen a highly interesting subject for your investigation, for we were in urgent need of such a summary of

the most important things contained in that vast and clumsy compilation which nevertheless is an extremely rich mine of knowledge

Dr C A F Rhys Davids —Your chapters are useful

Dr Sten Konow —It is a very useful work, as the *Mahāvastu* itself is so vast that it is difficult to find our way through it

Dr E J Thomas —You have succeeded in presenting the characteristic features in an attractive way and yet have done it so that one really gets a true impression of what the *Mahāvastu* is like. There is one criticism which you have already recognised yourself that a study of the *Mahāvastu* should really mean a discussion of the problem of its composition, etc., and this you have now given in the supplement

Dr A V Williams Jackson —I went through the volume with interest marking numerous passages in *your scholarly analysis*. I am glad to have the work. I read also with interest Prof Keith's scholarly note which prefaces your volume very auspiciously

Dr F W Thomas —Your account of the *Mahāvastu* will make known the contents of the book to many people who might otherwise fail to have knowledge of it. The Index of names also will be of use to those who cannot refer to M. Senart's very elaborate Index and even to others who wish to make a rapid acquaintance with the work your volume will be acceptable. Both volumes are well printed on good paper, and I am glad to possess them

Dr W S Urquhart —I have read the greater part of it and have found much interest and profit in it

Mahamahopadhyaya Dr R Shama Shastri Arthasastra Vistarada — * * * your learned work, 'A Study of the *Mahāvastu*' I admire your energy, patient study and research

Your new work, 'A Study of the Mahavastu,' is a valuable contribution to the history of Buddhism.

Dr. D R Bhandarkar Like all other books this also is a meritorious production and is sure to be useful to the students of Buddhist history and literature

Dr R C Mazumdar . The absence of an English translation of Mahavastu makes your book specially valuable.

J. R A S, April 1931: The Mahavastu is well-known for being in its arrangement, as Dr. Law says, most disorderly and full of repetitions. He has, therefore, gone through the entire text and given translations of the most important passages, and by classing the material under three heads, the Buddhas and Bodhisattvas, Gautama Buddha, and Stories, he has succeeded in presenting an interesting picture of the legendary portion of the whole. The plates, reproductions of Indian sculpture and painting, are most appropriate and attractive. His method of analysis is excellent, and he has succeeded in preserving the impression of the original arrangement. This, except for a page of introduction and a note by Professor Keith, is all that he gives us, and it is not exactly what we mean by a study. However, he has since made up for this by issuing a Supplement, in which ten pages are devoted to Avadana or Apadana contrasted with Jataka, the importance of the study of the Mahavastu, religion and philosophy, and other important questions. The remainder consists of a useful table of correspondence with Senart's edition and further extracts from the work.

Archiv Orientalni, IV, 1932: The Mahavastu throws a flood of light on the history of Buddhist literature, especially as regards the development of the Buddha legend, and the literature of Jatakas and Avadanas Both by its language and its composition the Mahavastu is very difficult to translate. Hence no attempt has yet been made of a

translation of the complete text Under these circumstances students of Buddhism will be thankful to Dr B C Law for having given in this volume the substance of the Mahavastu in the form of longer and shorter extracts in English

The "Supplement" which has been published separately, contains a useful "Table of Correspondence, showing to which pages in Senart's edition the extracts correspond, besides notes on Jatakas and Avadanas, on the importance of the Mahavastu and on its date * * * It also contains resume of some Jatakas, some legends of conversion, and the account of the origin of lingship Students of Buddhism who are not always able to find their way through the maze of the Mahavastu text itself, will find these "Studies on so important a text very useful

The Calcutta Review September 1930 — * * * "The services of Dr Bimala Churn Law are indeed very great because out of that apparently disorderly work he has tried to evolve system and encourage people to study it by showing that the study would be profitable The repetitions were useful when Buddhism was a living force in India but in the 20th century they have no living interest and Dr Law has done well to discard them all and give us the substance of the whole thing in plain and business like language He has attempted to divide his work in three sections (1) Buddhists and Bodhisattvas, (2) Gautama Buddha, and (3) Stories This is very good for modern readers who, I am sure, will thank him for evolving order out of what seems to be an impenetrable disorder * * * The scene of Rahula's conversion is pathetic in the extreme Dr Law gives the story of this conversion and I am sure readers will be greatly interested in it * * * The Mahavastu is a great work not only because it is the history of Buddha for several cycles of kalpas but also for the great ideas of creation, of the origin of government, and of other topics of supreme importance in ancient India * * * The descriptions of cities, gardens, palaces, processions, etc, are not only

vivid and life-like but true so far as ancient India is concerned. Some of the scenes are exceedingly beautiful. We owe it to Dr. Law's indefatigable exertion of making Buddhist ideas available to modern readers that this great work has been made accessible to the modern readers in a presentable shape. It is very convenient to read Dr. Law's 'A Study of the Mahavastu'; as I have said before by avoiding repetitions he has greatly facilitated the study of the ideas of the book and by separating the earlier migration of the Buddha spirit from the life of Gautama Buddha, he has still more facilitated its study. By the separation of the Jataka stories from the body of the book he has made its study easy. It is a great want that he has supplied and future generations will be greatly benefited by his exertions.

(Reviewed by Mm Dr H. P. Shastri, C I E, D Litt)

The Times Literary Supplement, 4th September 1930: The Mahavastu is generally regarded as a book of the Buddhist scriptures, as part of one of the Pitakas, the Vinaya. Its canonicity is sometimes doubted but the probability is, as Dr Keith explains, that it has been written over many times at very different periods so that it is impossible to date it and it is full of confusion and repetition. The Buddha appears in it sometimes as a normal human being, sometimes as of divine birth, sometimes as the embodiment of vast conceptions remote from humanity. Even the language is mixed, mainly Pali, but with a mingling of Prakrit and Sanskrit. This treatise is a studious and scholarly work.

Quarterly Journal of the Mythic Society (New Series, Vol. XXI, No 2): This is a short account of Buddhist legends and doctrines relating to the Mahayana school. Mon E. Senait's bulky volumes being now unfortunately rare and out of print, the present work is doubly welcome. Dr B. C. Law gives us the gist of the original in a readable and handy form without much omission. His scholarship in the field of Buddhist Literature

and History is well known and he is well fitted for his task, for, he has fairly succeeded in condensing the loose and discursive Buddhist legends and placing a book of reference in the hands of students of Buddhism. The Mahāvastu which claims to be a book of the Vinaya Pīṭaka contains, however, very little of the rules of the Vinaya. It gives us the birth stories and doctrines of Lokottaravādīn School. Here the Buddha is "no mortal teacher" but a "*Bhagavan*," that is, an *avatar*. The doctrines and stories "breathe the spirit of the Purāṇas," testifying to the inter relation of the Buddhist and Brahmanical schools of thought. The volume is profusely illustrated and has a prefatory note by Dr. A. B. Keith. The Supplement deals with some matters left unnoticed in the original, and discusses at some length the problems raised by Dr. A. B. Keith in his prefatory note to the study of the Mahāvastu, such as the age, the style and importance of the book in the Buddhist canonical literature.

The Indian Review February 1931 —Students of Buddhism should be grateful to Dr. Law for making available to them in this readable form the substance of the Mahāvastu, one of the important books of Mahāyāna literature. Mahāvastu means a big thing as it appropriately forms the title of an unwieldy chaos of Buddhist legends, stories and doctrines. And the language in which it is written presents as much difficulty as the subject matter. It is neither Sanskrit nor Pāli nor Prakrit, but an unstable combination of all the three. Dr. Keith who has contributed a note on the Mahāvastu says that for lack of a better term it might be called mixed Sanskrit. Moreover it is now clear to which school the book exactly belongs. It claims to belong to Vinaya Pīṭaka according to the text of the Lokottaravādīns. But it contains very little of the rules of the Vinaya. So in every way the Mahāvastu is a tangled mass. And it is no small help that Dr. Law has rendered to students of Buddhism in the present book which gives us a fairly good idea of the contents of the original. His account is divided

into two parts. The first part which contains two chapters deals with the Buddhas and the Bodhisattvas including Gautama the Buddha. And the second part gives a number of stories or Jataka tales.

XIII

BUDDHISTIC STUDIES

Contents	<i>The Buddhism of Manimekalai — Buddhist Councils — Six heretical teachers — Gautama Buddha and the Parivrajakas — Mahavira and Buddha — The quest of the Historic Sakya Muni — Some ancient Indian Kings — Buddhist education in Pali & Sanskrit schools — Ancient Indian education from the Jatalas — Buddhist conception of Mara — Dukkha and Sulha — Faith in Buddhism — Buddhist philosophy of birth and death — Buddhist Vinaya discipline — Some Numismatic data in Pali Literature — History of Buddhism in Ceylon — Buddhist festivals in Ceylon — The authenticity of Asoka legends — Wanted a philosophy of life? — Buddhism — Nibbana — Man as Willer — Asoka and his mission — Buddhism in Western Asia — Origin & development of Pali language with special reference to Sanskrit grammar — Buddhist iconoclasm and idolatry — A comparative study of Hindu and Buddhist mythology — Buddhism in Tamil Literature — Alasam Paksanam gathik — On Karma — A short history of Ceylon — The home of Pali — Outlines of the history of Buddhism in Indo China — Christian mysticism in the light of the Buddha's doctrine — Claps from a Buddhist workshop — Philosophy of Lanavatara — A note on Bodhisattva Iokanatha and other Mahayana gods in Burma</i>
----------	--

Dr Keith —It is most satisfactory that you should have succeeded in securing so many and varied communications together forming a very important addition to our knowledge of Buddhist philosophy and religion, history and philology. I am sure that we all greatly appreciate your services to Indian studies both directly through your own work, and indirectly by thus bringing together the results of the labours of many other scholars engaged in research.

Dr Barnett —The publication of this fine spiritual puspanjali is a punya of a high order, and you have thereby laid the world of scholarship under a deep debt of gratitude to you.

Mrs Rhys Davids —I congratulate you on the accomplishment of a long drawn out task of editing, etc.

Dr. F. W. Thomas: Your remarkable volume of 'Buddhistic Studies,' contributed by so many able scholars * * * I have only been able to sip at it and read one or two articles, such as your own concerning the parivrajakas and concerning the kings and Mr. C. D. Chatterjee's original material concerning numismatics, and Mr. Finot's Outlines of the History of Buddhism in Indo-China. But I can see that you have dealt with very many departments of Buddhist study and have assembled a mass of information and critical inquiry including not a few new lights. I was interested to glance through (with a view to careful perusal later) the characteristically independent contribution of our venerable friend Mahamahopadhyaya Haraprasad, giving, as always, an impression of good sense, originality and independent information.

Dr. Winternitz: You have been fortunate in bringing together such a large number of interesting and important papers dealing with some of the greatest problems in the history of Buddhism.

Prof. Dr. W. Geiger: An excellent work, and it was indeed a splendid idea to collect in one volume the various and sometimes different opinions of the various scholars on the various subjects of Buddhism.

Dr. W. Stede: It is a great asset to have them all collected into one handsome book, covering nearly all the most important points of Buddhist Studies.

Dr. K. J. Saunders: Congratulate you on a very useful compendium.

Mon. L. Finot: Your splendid volume of Buddhist Studies * * * plunged into it with an unmixed feeling of *pīṭisukha*.

Mon. J. Przyluski: You have found out a happy plan in uniting upon the same common ground some excellent scholars of

both the east and the west. The book which has come out from this collaboration is suggestive and extraordinarily varied.

Dr E J Thomas — * * * your handsome and valuable volume of *Buddhist Studies*. I am very glad to see in it the union of Eastern and Western Scholars, but still it must be admitted that the work as a whole is Eastern. It is of the greatest value and importance to me to be able to learn about facts of the present day from those who can understand them best, as well as to see how our theories of ancient thought are conceived by those who have actually inherited them. All this contributes to the ideal that we have before us, to raise a structure of thought which can only be done by the co-operation of all, and this work shows what an important part you are yourself playing in making a way to the goal.

Prof E J Rapson — Please allow me to congratulate you on its production. The various articles by yourself and other scholars constitute a valuable survey of Buddhism in its different aspects, and I am very glad to be the possessor of this important work.

Mahamahopadhyaya Dr Ganganath Jha M A D Litt C I E
Vice Chancellor Allahabad University — It is a very interesting and instructive symposium and is sure to prove very useful.

Sir George A Grierson Kt K C I E — Valuable collection of Buddhist studies. * * * I have already dipped into it here and there and can anticipate the pleasure I shall derive from it.

The Right Hon ble the Marquess of Zetland — I hope that the book will meet with the reception which I am sure that it deserves.

Rai Bahadur Dayaram Sahnı M A Director General of Archaeology in India — I have read this book with great interest.

incorporated in the volume were originally published in the Indian Historical Quarterly and at the time drew considerable public attention by reason of their research and scholarship and the publication of this collection of literature ' ' ' ' ' cannot be too highly praised. Gautama Buddha's doctrine represents to us a concrete philosophy. It once revolutionised man's conception of life and letters, art and architecture, religion and philosophy. The personality of Buddha, as is well-known to all and as will be apparent to those reading between the lines of this volume, had cast a magnetic spell over his followers who are still to be found at many places throughout the world. The idea of proselytism was his own and is said to have originated from him. It was he who for the first time in Indian history ruthlessly and irremediably broke the barriers of caste, colour and creed and boldly admitted proselytism in their fold. It was no doubt an absolutely necessary religious upheaval as we have said before. And the book, we doubt not, will open before its readers a flood-gate of many ideas that are instructive and illuminating. Among the various chords which are struck in this book under review, there may be some to which the mind of the reader will respond, and which may entice him in the search for that religious and spiritual illumination associated with the life of Gautama Buddha.

The Hindusthan Review, October-December 1931. Dr Bimala Churn Law's *Buddhistic Studies* is an excellent collection of thoughtful papers on Buddhism and Jainism, written by many renowned scholars of Asia and Europe. It is full of new materials and is well-documented. Social, economical, religious and philosophical aspects of Buddhism and Jainism, have been well treated of in this bulky volume. Students of the history of Ceylon will find this work very useful. The book, as a whole, is a valuable and useful compendium of essays on various aspects of Buddhism and Jainism, and will be of great interest to scholars and students of both these religions.

Capital 7th April 1932 —Dr Law, whose researches in the domain of Buddhist religion and philosophy are arduous and withal varied, has made another very learned and interesting contribution on the subject in the book under notice. It is a collection of articles on Buddhism from learned Buddhist scholars and divines strung together in a volume of about 900 pages dealing with the various aspects of the teachings of the Buddha. Each article has been given a separate chapter and the chapters run into a total of thirty six. They were originally published in the *Indian Historical Quarterly* and Dr Law thought it wise to lift them from the ephemeral pages of a quarterly and give them an abiding place in the already rich and diversified Buddhist literature. We have no hesitation in commending his decision. A close and careful study of the pages of *Buddhist Studies* will enable the reader to grasp the tenets and broad principles of Buddhism without difficulty. It will save him the trouble of exploring the intricate mazes of Buddhist texts and unravel the skein of Buddhist philosophic thought. Lucidity is the distinguishing feature of all the articles and their arrangement is such that the book very easily leads the reader from the first to the final stage of Buddhist thought—the birth and early history of Buddhism, its many vicissitudes and its final development. The chapters on Buddhism and Idolatry, Christian Mysticism in the Light of the Buddha's Doctrine, Chips from a Buddhist Workshop, Dukkha and Sukha, the Buddhist Philosophy of Birth and Death, to mention only a few, will be found highly interesting and edifying. They make a spontaneous appeal to the reader and impress him with the truth they seek to convey. Dr Law has our congratulations on the success with which he has pieced together the immortal truths of Buddhism in this book and revealed the Light of Asia through an altogether new prism.

The Indian Literary Review March 1932 —Here for the first time are collected together many articles, written by leaders of

thought both Eastern and Western, on various aspects of Buddhist philosophy. Recently after the Great War, Buddhism has appealed very strongly to a people famished for truth and trying to find a real guidance. Nations dissatisfied with religions that condoned and sanctioned the killing of millions of human beings, have been able to find a ray of light in the teachings of love propounded by the Buddha, and are eagerly seeking out avenues to embrace in practice his eight-fold path to Salvation. And to such, as well as to those who have only a confused idea of what Buddhism stands for, this collection edited by the learned Dr. Law will be welcome as a practical guidance to the solution of problems. The contributors include Dr. S. Krishnaswamy Aiyangar, Dr. R. C. Majumdar, Mr. K. P. Jain, Dr. K. J. Saunders, Dr. E. J. Thomas, Dr. Radhakumud Mukerjee, Mr. E. H. Brewster, Dr. B. M. Barua, Rev. Narada, Dr. M. Nagai, Mr. C. D. Chatterjee, Dr. W. A. De Silva, Mr. S. Paranavitana, Drs. Keith, Geiger, Thomas, Rhys Davids, Finot, Gumm, and the last but not least the learned editor who contributes many valuable papers on various aspects of Buddhism. It is a regular galaxy of oriental scholars that face us and all have made history relive for us by their assiduous researches. This is a valuable *vade mecum*, and Dr. Law deserves thanks for his laborious task in giving to the world a connected and analytic account of Buddhism and its philosophy. It is a valuable contribution to the history of religions.

Quarterly Journal of the Mythic Society, April 1932: With the publication of this book, Dr. Bimala Churn Law adds yet another volume to the long and valuable series of interesting and instructive studies of Buddhism upon which he has, for many years past, been usefully engaged. In "Heaven and Hell in Buddhist Perspective" Dr. Law put before the reader the Buddhist idea of Heaven and Hell, in "Some Ksatriya Tribes of Ancient India" and "Ancient Mid-Indian Ksatriya

Tribes" he gave a narrative of the history, manners and customs of some Kṣatriya tribes of ancient India together with a detailed historical and geographical account of some ancient Kṣatriya tribes of Mid India (valley of Upper Ganges and its tributaries) respectively, in "Life and Work of Buddhaghosa" he presented us with an illuminating portrait of the most celebrated commentator of the Theravāda School of Buddhism and in "Historical Gleanings" he published a collection of six essays dealing with subjects of historical importance. The book under review contains as many as thirty six interesting monographs contributed by such renowned Eastern and Western scholars as Mrs C A F Rhys Davids, Dr A B Keith, Dr D R Bhandarkar, Dr B M Barua, Mahamahopadhyaya Dr Haraprasad Sastri and Dr Bimal Churn Law. This short Encyclopædia of Buddhism and Buddhist Literature is bound to be of immense use to all students of Buddhist History Literature and Religion and Pali, the canonical language of the Buddhists.

The Buddhist June 1932 —Hitherto students of Buddhism and its kindred literature had been grateful to Dr Law for his own learned researches, published in various forms chiefly his exhaustive and splendid monograph on Buddhaghosa. Now he comes before us in another role, as editor and author (more editor than author) providing a great intellectual feast. The volume before us runs into over 900 pages and includes several pages of illustrations as well. Dr Law has succeeded in rallying round him for his publication the scholarly elite of many lands, all names well known and each writing on themes which have formed subjects of their long and laborious studies. It is quite obvious that the editor's task has been mainly that of diplomatic persuasion in gaining the writer's consent to write something for his volume. The choice of topics he has left entirely free to the writers of the papers themselves. The outcome is a tremendous amount of variety diverse in character as well as in form. This, though it

perhaps tends to make the volume more valuable, makes a reviewer's task extremely difficult. Some of the papers seem to have been merely meant as peace-offerings to escape further pursuits by the editor's blandishments. They are just digests of the authors' own previous works served up in popular form. Such, for instance, in Geiger's *Short History of Ceylon*. Others are notes gathered together gleanings from various fields, e.g., Haraprasad Shastri's "*Chips from a Buddhist Workshop*," profitably arranged for the student. Yet others are compilations from various sources, put together with the scientific training of the research scholar. Amongst the longest paper is one by our own veteran student, Dr W. A. de Silva, who writes on the *History of Buddhism in Ceylon*. He has gathered together a vast amount of material from all sorts of sources, some of them hitherto unexplored. Particularly the part of the essay dealing with the modern period is a masterly survey. Among other Ceylon contributors are Bhikkhu Siddhartha, Mr S. Paranavitana and Bhikkhu Narada. Bhikkhu Siddhartha writes on *The Origin and Development of the Pali Language with special reference to Sanskrit Grammar*. His profound knowledge of the two languages makes his conclusions specially valuable, though how far his theories will be accepted by critical scholars of other lands will be a matter for much surmise, if we are to judge the hypotheses current amongst them from a similar article by Dr. Berriedale Keith who contributes a very learned paper on the *Home of Pali*. Dr. Keith questions the genuineness of practically every theory which has hitherto found acceptance among research scholars and throws down a direct challenge to the orthodox scholars. Mr. Paranavitana's paper on *Buddhist Festivals in Ceylon* bears the characteristics of thoroughness and scholarship which we got accustomed to expect from him. Bhikkhu Narada's two articles on *Samsara* and *Nibbana* show a wide acquaintance with Buddhism, its religio-philosophical aspects and form quite interesting reading. He writes convincingly, though too much like the apologist. Mrs. Rhys Davids'

rigorous plea for the consideration of Man as Willer strikes a different note altogether. Here sounds like a voice in the wilderness, but if the enthusiasm in her recent pronouncements at the Leyden Congress of Orientalists is any clue to the conviction which she has brought to European students of Buddhist lore, then its echoes will be far reaching. Space will not permit us to write in detail of many other papers which the volume contains. But mention must be made at least by name of Dr Kenneth Saunders' article entitled *The Quest of the Historic Sakya Muni*, Dr E. J. Thomas' *Buddhist Education in Pali and Sanskrit Schools*, Dr M. Nagai's *Buddhist Vinaya Discipline*, Dr B. M. Barua's *Faith in Buddhism* and Dr Radhakumud Mukerjee's two papers on *Ancient Indian Education* and *The Authenticity of Asokan Legends*. They are very well written, clear, concise, unpadding. Dr George Grimm's essay on *Christian Mysticism in the Light of Buddha's Doctrine* shows an enviable knowledge of the 'esoteric' side of both the religions and is a development of the same writer's views found in his earlier volumes on Buddhism. There are two essays dealing with Buddhism in Tamil literature, one by the well known expert in south Indian antiquities, Dr Krishnaswami Aiyangar, who writes on the *Buddhism of Manimekhalai*, and the other by his successor, Mr Ramachandra Dikshitar. Mons. Louis Finot's contribution on the *Outlines of the History of Buddhism in Indo China* is one of the best of the essays, and the volume deserves the price charged for it for this alone. Dr Law himself has written several papers where he reveals, as usual, his profuse energies and his unquenchable thirst for knowledge.

To use rather an unBuddhistic expression "the egg is very full of meat," and it cannot be done justice for in a short sitting like this. It can provide a rich repast for many long days. Dr Law deserves the applause of all for his energy and enthusiasm, not to mention the great expense it must have meant to him for so splendid a production.

J R. A. S., July, 1932: ' ' ' To a great degree is it commendable, that there should be found a man like Dr. Law, willing to take upon himself the financial burden of giving, not to his own "fliegende Blätter" only, but to those of many other workers in the same field, a more concordant and more permanent abiding-place than that of a quarterly journal, or other periodical. Of his own four contributions to this volume he has let me see three from other publications. I am not sure whether the fourth, "The Buddhist Conception of Mara," has previously appeared. This is, like much else from the same pen, the work of the useful secretary, reaching down from bookshelves materials (varying in date of composition over about a thousand years) needed for his projected work by the historian of such a "conception," and greatly is such a writer beholden to him. the critical essayist will be glad to have it by him. Of other essays which I have not seen before in periodicals, one by a Jain, K Piasad Jain, on "Mahavira and Buddha" ' ' ' It is 66 pages in length, and in its own way of no little interest ' ' ' Such a comparison, as is given, is useful, as showing what, when both scriptures took their final shapes, was then the orthodox doctrine of either cult ' ' ' Another article which may here appear for the first time is one by my esteemed contributor (speaking for the Pali Text Society), Dr. M. Nagai, on "Buddhist Vinaya Discipline." Here we have another slap, that of the Mahayanist at the Hinayanist. This is at the need felt in the Pali scriptures to give sanction to every rule by prefixing the *Anujanami vo bhikkhave* of the Sakyamuni. ' ' ' The attitude of the modern cultured Japanese Buddhist towards this ancient mass of "canon law" is of much interest ' ' ' One more article, refreshingly short, not apparently a reprint, is in a way the most suggestive of all: "Wanted a Philosophy of life? Buddhism" by C. E. Ball ' ' ' Space does not suffer that I do more than mention other articles. Dr. G. Grimm on "Christian Mysticism ' ' ' Buddha's Doctrine", Dr. Bhandarkar's Asokan study and others, or I

could say much more. When it is a case of external history, as in the contributions on Buddhist history in Ceylon by Drs Geiger and De Silva, there is obviously no choice for the writers to be anything but historical * * * This volume will go down to posterity * * * with a great amount of interesting research.

The Buddhist Annual of Ceylon Vol IV No 2 1932 — This is a novel work. It is composed of essays on various aspects of the Dhamma by well known writers, some of whom are scholars of high eminence. Dr Law, himself a learned scholar, has written several articles. His selection of writers has been happy, hailing as they do both from the East and West * * * we welcome this work, on which the Editor has lavished a great deal of labour.

XIV

THE LIFE AND WORK OF BUDDHAGHOSA

Contents *Life of Buddhaghosa — Legends about Buddhaghosa — Origin and development of Buddhist Commentaries — Buddhaghosa's works — The Successor of Buddhaghosa — The Encyclopedic Character of Buddhaghosa's works — The philosophy of Buddhaghosa — Buddhaghosa's interpretation of Buddhism — Conclusion*

Mrs. Rhys Davids (Extracts from the foreword): * * * a last word on the subject ' ' ' the book is all the more needed now as a very useful compendium of what we yet know of Buddhaghosa, both from his own works and from other documents. Theories about the great commentator are cropping up. They rest on a more or less slender basis of evidence from lack of more historical prolegomena such as this book affords.

Dr. Wilh. Geiger: The treatise on Buddhaghosa is an excellent monograph on the celebrated commentator of the holy Buddhist scriptures. All the questions connected with the date, the life, and the work of Buddhaghosa are discussed in a most methodical and exhaustive manner. I have read with special interest the Chapter III on the origin and development of Buddhist commentaries which is, indeed, a beautiful example of learned inquiry into that subject.

Dr J. Estlin Carpenter: It is very important to have such a collection as you have gathered of the various data contained in his great commentaries, and your additional illustrations are full of interest. Your chapters on the origin of the commentaries, and the interpretation of Buddhism by Buddhaghosa bring many valuable side-lights on the history of Buddhism and its consolidation as a system of thought in the Thera-vada. : : : Your excellent volume will be a great help to future student.

Dr L D Barnett — * * * it seems to me that your book, by its careful study of all the data relative to the great Master of Southern Buddhism, forms a valuable contribution to knowledge, especially in its treatment of the relation of Buddhaghosa to his predecessors and contemporaries

The Young Men of India September 1924 — In the biographical literature of India as a whole the Life of Buddhaghosa would prove to be an important work and supply a long felt want. The life story of the great scholar is in reality a section of Indian history, and occupies a unique place in the course of Buddhist thought. Prof Lanman has remarked "Of all the names in the history of Buddhist scholasticism Buddhaghosa's is the most illustrious. He is not less renowned in the East than his famous contemporary, St Augustine in the West, and for the same reasons—sanctity of life wide learning and great literary achievements (*Hindu Yoga System* p 46). Dr Law has rightly called him the "Sayan of Buddhism" (p 1). The eight chapters which go to make the book are replete with scholarly information and judgment. Mrs Rhys Davids says, in her introduction to the book, that "Mr Law has gone deeper into the works ascribed to Buddhaghosa than any other English writing author, * * * and into the works referring to Buddhaghosa than most men" (Intro, p vi). Dr Law fully deserves this tribute from the great authority on Buddhism in the West for his masterly treatment of this difficult subject. He has, indeed, contributed something to the modern knowledge of Buddhism by bringing together vast masses of facts from all quarters to make Buddhaghosa live a real life, as he used to do centuries ago. Special mention ought to be made of the portions dealing with Buddhaghosa's encyclopædic knowledge and his advanced philosophy (Chaps VI and VII). The author has observed "The whole of Buddhist Philosophy along with Buddhist religion rests on a psychological basis. Yet more marked is the psychological advance met with in the works of

Buddhaghosa It was Buddhaghosa who developed and perfected the Buddhist system of thought" (pp. 138 and 157) Yet the Buddhist scholar was not merely a metaphysician "His works abound in references to history, geography, astronomy, dancing, music, anatomy, bird-life, jugglery and so forth "

It is hoped that this biography will bring about a better understanding of the period of history represented by Buddhaghosa's life and that school of Buddhism to which he belonged, and scholars working on that line will find this work highly suggestive, useful and helpful for further advance.

The Expository Times. Our knowledge of these two great men (Buddhaghosa and Vasuvandhu) is considerably advanced by two new works, that of Mr B C Law upon Buddhaghosa and that of Dr Stcherbatsky, the Central Conception of Buddhism These are of great value to the advanced student and a mere glance at them ought to make it clear to the intelligent lay reader that here is the Buddhist scholasticism concerning itself with psychological and ontological questions quite beyond the range of the masses in any Buddhist sect, and indeed capable of being understood by only few specialists among the monks The two commentaries here studied, the Visuddhimagga of Buddhaghosa and the Abhidharmakosa of Vasuvandhu are indeed great and epoch-making works but they have hardly affected the Buddhism of the masses Scholars would be grateful for these works and for the great number of other people interested in Buddhism, they will at least serve to show that its thinkers were systematic and profound All these books are indications of a new and more scientific study of Buddhism and remind us how impressive and varied are its forms, and how deep a gulf separates its masses from its philosophers and even its monks These reflections are of much more practical consequences than they may seem

Le Museon (T xxxvii) Brussels — With a good index, treats a difficult subject and is not sensibly inferior to it. Without doubt a certain amount of haste in the resume of the Philosophy of Buddhaghosa, but an abundant erudition and of a good standard.

The International Review of Missions London July 1924 — The literary labour of the monks of Ceylon on the Pāli Tripiṭaka culminated in the splendid series of noble expositions and commentaries produced by Buddhaghosa in the first half of the fifth century A D. So fair and so accurate is the work of this great scholar that his help in the understanding of the Pāli canon is of the very greatest value. Dr Law has brought together in his monograph every scrap of evidence to be found in the old literature throwing light on his life and labours. His book will be of very great value especially to young students, but also to every one who seriously desires to understand the Buddhism of Ceylon. He is to be congratulated on a very fresh and valuable contribution to Buddhist science.

J R A S April 1924 — * * * a well executed piece of work in which he has collected all the historical and semi historical materials bearing on the life and labours of the great Master of the Law and sifted them with considerable ability, supplementing this by chapters on the origin and development of the standard commentaries on the Buddhist scriptures (a very interesting expose), on Buddhaghosa's successors (Buddhadatta, Dhammapāla, Mahānāma, the younger Moggallāna, and Culla Buddhaghosa), and on his writings * * * the book is really good.

Indian Antiquary August 1924 — Here we have a brief but comprehensive account of all that is known of the most celebrated commentator of the Theravada School of Buddhism. The book may, in some respects, be regarded as a reply to the theory lately propounded by M. Louis Finot that Buddhaghosa is not a historical personage, and that he did not

compose the many important commentaries and other works which bear his name. Despite the scantiness of the materials which support the story of the great commentator's life, it must, in my opinion, be admitted that Dr. Law has successfully disproved M. Finot's views and has produced a credible account of Buddhaghosa's life and literary labours. Commencing his treatise with the biographical details obtainable from the Mahavamsa and other sources, the author proceeds to an examination of the legends which have grown up around his name, discusses the origin and development of the Buddhist commentaries, and then after a critical examination of Buddhaghosa's works and interesting illustrations of their encyclopædic character, they embrace information upon such various subjects as History and Anatomy, Dancing and Ornithology, Astronomy and Jugglery he concludes his work with an explanation of Buddhaghosa's philosophy and his interpretation of Buddhism.

There can be no doubt about the great erudition, zeal and self-denying labours of the man whom Bishop Copleston once styled "the Second Founder of Buddhism in Ceylon", and students of Pali literature and others interested in the religion founded by the Buddha will be grateful to Dr. Law for this well-written and well-printed summary of all that is worth knowing, or that can be known after the lapse of fifteen hundred years about the sage interpreter of Buddhist literature.

Bulletin de l' Ecole Française d' Extrême Orient (tome xxv): The Life and Work of Buddhaghosa is a compendium of traditional data relating to the legendary figure and some features of the work attributed to him. Particularly appreciable are the developments collected from exegetic literature (Ch III), of the successor of Buddhaghosa (Ch V) and of the varied acknowledgments that refer to his work—grammar, geography, anatomy, sects, tribes, sovereigns of India, reminiscences of Ceylon, etc. The chapter on the philosophy of Buddhaghosa is not without merit, as it is difficult to distinguish that which

in this matter appertains to the commentator from that which belongs to the stock of current ideas of the epoch in the Buddhist converts. In conclusion, B. C. LAW courteously expresses the regret for not being able to accept the views that I have expressed in an article upon the legend of Buddhaghosa. I pray him to believe that the regret is reciprocal, and that I have a great desire to find in his work some good reasons for admitting the historical reality of the hero. If a work, as conscientious as his, has not been able to make this demonstration, it is to be feared that it will take itself a long time.

* * * It is not necessary besides to exaggerate the range of this difference. Mr. LAW recognises that all the quotations other than that from Cullavamsa are pure legends. He holds of this that Brahmans of the north of India came to Ceylon in the sixth century for translating the *uttharathas* into Pali and that he spent his life on this work within the four walls of his cell. I add for the reasons that I have said to find this theory untrue but that the colourless and half abstract rupa with which Mr. LAW satisfies himself is to be completed by the name of Buddhaghosa for giving it an appearance of an individuality. This in reality is not of much importance. In the preface written by Mrs. Rhys Davids (the gifted lady as Mr. LAW calls her) she maintains with the same force that Buddhaghosa was a historical person, a historically real man, teaching and writing in the fifth century A.D. in Ceylon, as as he may now be teaching and writing it may be on earth, it may be in another world. That Buddhaghosa wrote in the fifth century is precisely that what I have desired to say in other terms. We are very near each other in holding this in all cases whether Buddhaghosa was or was not a historical person. The attemptive study that Mr. LAW has made of the commentaries which carry his (Buddhaghosa's) name, protects all its utility or value.

WOMEN IN BUDDHIST LITERATURE

Contents *Marriage — Slave girls — Dancing girls and courtesan — Female character — Female education — Women and Buddhism — Bhikkhuni Sangha — Prominent Buddhist Women*

Dr. L. D. Barnett: The collection of facts that you have assembled will be very useful

Mrs. Rhys Davids: It is useful to have such allusions from Pali and Buddhist Sanskrit works schematised * * * orderly collection.

Dr. A. B. Keith: Thank you for the gift of an excellent book. Those collections of material are invaluable for the progress of scholarship and your material is so attractively set forth that there is equal pleasure and profit in its perusal.

Dr. M. Winternitz: It is a very valuable collection of data from Buddhist literature

Dr. D. R. Bhandarkar: Full of new matter and has been written in a scholarly fashion

Dr. E. J. Thomas The book keeps faithfully to its title and gives us in a very interesting way a picture of what Buddhist literature says about women. From this point of view it is not important whether the tale is a mere legend or really historical, for a tale even if invented shows the kind of opinion that the Buddhists of the period held about women.

Dr. Th. Stcherbatsky: It is a fascinating subject and you have treated it admirably

Dr. Sten Konow: Like your previous publications, it is a very useful collection of materials, carefully sifted and arranged, and

many fellow scholars will be thankful to you for saving them the trouble of searching for such information as you have given in the vast Buddhist literature

Prof Dr F O Schrader —I find it so instructive that I should like to see another copy of it with your dedication in the library of the Indogermanisches Seminar der Universität Kiel where it will doubtless be much appreciated especially by my lady students * * * monographs of yours on various aspects of Buddhism are, indeed, quite worthy of acknowledgment, as I wrote you already, I believe, when receiving your *Buddhist Conception of Spirits*

The Ceylon Morning Leader April 17 1928 —The public of Ceylon will be grateful to Messrs W E Bastian & Co for their enterprise in publishing this fascinating book, *Women in Buddhist Literature* Mr Bimala Churn Law, its author has stripped the narrative of all accretions and given us pen pictures of the women of Buddhist literature in a remarkable and crowded gallery The characters are drawn from the sources of Pali literature and their collection indicates a close and robust scholarship The material is not expanded by imaginative embroiderings for the mere purpose of filling space It is undoubtedly a virtue in these days of expansive writing This commendable method has, however the defect of its merit The characters bear a very strong family resemblance either for good or for ill Very few of them have the effects of full length portraits Their virtues lead to insight their vices show them to belong to

THE SISTERHOOD OF THE FRAILTY

Apart from this book is interesting It opens out unfamiliar ground We are back with the author in an interesting world of antiquity The customs of other times have set their impress invisibly or visibly upon their latest posterity It is good to know what were the impressions of great contemporaries

upon the women of this ancient time We see much of the kinship of the past with present It is a book that will delight the heart of a satirist of womankind of the present age. He will find that his excesses of denunciation can be paralleled with what men of great name have spoken of women of their day He will also see in the assemblage of the virtuous women of antiquity, and their name is legion, a kinship with the good women of the present time who seek in cloistral solitude a release from the distractions of desire and the slavery of worldly life It is interesting to know the

BUDDHA'S CONCEPTION OF THE IDEAL WOMAN,

quoted by the author from the Dīgha Nikāya. "The ideal woman," says the author, "is described by the Buddha himself in the Mahā Sudassana Sutta of the Dīgha Nikāya There the Buddha says that the woman who is handsome, beautiful in appearance, pleasing in manner and of the most fine complexion, neither too tall, nor too short, neither too thin nor too fat, neither too dark nor too fair, and who possesses divine beauty surpassing human beauty is an *itthi-ratana*, a jewel among women" It will be noticed that the final emphasis is upon the aspect which transcends the human If women were evil and regarded as such, there is also a large mass of evidence to show that they deserve the highest praise by reason of their virtue and learning The example of women of great attainments in knowledge is inspiring The influence of

THE TEACHING OF BUDDHA

had a great effect in converting large numbers of women who dedicated themselves to meditation and the religious life The formation of the *Bikkhuni Samgha* when Mahāpajāpatī the Gotamī and five hundred ladies cut themselves off from the world to institute the order of nuns is an interesting and fascinating chapter The leader of the order was at first opposed by the Buddha but later he yielded to the pleadings of Ananda, saying "If then Ananda, Mahāpajāpatī the

Gotamī take upon herself the eight Chief Rules, let that be reckoned to her as her initiation. This was done and the Samgha was formed. Then follows some remarkable words from Buddha and Ananda: "If Ananda, women had not received permission to go out from the household life and enter the homeless state under the doctrine and discipline proclaimed by the Tathagata then would the pure religion, Ananda, have lasted long, the good law have stood fast for a thousand years. But since, Ananda, women have now received the permission, the pure religion, Ananda, will now not last for five hundred years. The prediction was fulfilled. But in spite of this, it is evident that

WOMEN PLAYED A GREAT PART

in Buddhist India by reason of their virtues, their learning and their devotion to the principles of Buddhism. The chapter entitled "Prominent Buddhist Women" is a wonderful record of their lives. These women, some of whom were of great beauty and reared amidst conditions of extraordinary luxury, proved equal to the practice of the most heroic virtue. They gave up all things in the world that held them in thrall before the days of their renunciation and showed a power of perseverance which would have done credit to men of the strongest will. These women were drawn from all classes. The one bond that united them together was

THE DESIRE OF RELEASE

from the lure of the world and the attainment of peace. The story of their diverse careers shows them to have been equal to making all manner of sacrifices. The story of their renunciation will therefore have a lesson for women of all classes who are led to read this unique and fascinating narrative. The book has also a great historical significance. It shows us to a great extent what were the governing motives of the lives of those who lived under ancient skies and in an era which we idealise not wholly because it is past. The same conditions,

are equally interesting and some of the facts appear peculiar to us. But we must not forget that it was a different age, and all sorts of female characters of that period are portrayed. Such motley characters we get also in Sanskrit and other ancient literatures. It is found that many a courtesan changed her life under the influence of that Great Teacher. All these may be summed up in the words of the author: "The Buddhist literature depicts the bright as well as the dark side of female character. It gives us a vivid picture of the inherent nature of the tender sex. The brightness of 'feminine virtue' is reflected specially in the lives of 'bhikkhunis' and 'theris'. It is indeed remarkable that tenderness of women could endure the hardship of religious life. The dark side of female character as portrayed in the Buddhist literature excites terror and hatred, though the delineation is a correct representation of facts" (p 42)

It will thus be apparent from attractive work Dr Law has produced. It deserves to be read daily. The printing and get-up are good.

The Indian Review, September 1928: This small book is an attempt to show how through and in Buddhism women secured a real advance, though at first they played an inconspicuous part. The material is mostly culled from Buddhist canonical and other works. The influence of the Buddha Dhamma on slave girls and courtesans is illustrated by means of several legends, and the depiction of women's character in Asvagosha's *Saundaryananda Kavya* is fairly summarised, the chastity as well as the vileness of women are both painted in rather strong colours in Buddhist literature where the references to educated women are numerous, indicating the acquisition of high qualities by them. A whole chapter is devoted to the account of the Bhikkhuni Samgha, its origin, organisation, and another describes the careers of some famous women who figure prominently in the early texts like Visakha and Anula.

J A O S March 1929 —Dr Bimāla Churn Law, whose monographs on Indian Tribes are well known, has published an attractive little volume on Women in Buddhist Literature (*Bastian*, Ceylon, 1927), which gives a systematic and quite complete treatment of the subject, with perhaps almost too many anecdotes that have no particular significance. Mr Law's English is on the whole impeccable but we doubt whether Buddha, being shocked at a woman's nakedness, said to her "Sister! Recover your shamelessness" (p. 111).

The Modern Review, January 1930 —In this well written volume Dr Law has given us this time a brief account of women as they are depicted either favourably or adversely in different stages of life, in Buddhist literature specially in Pāli. Indeed, one may know all about them from it in a nutshell.

The Hindusthan Review January 1930 —Dr Bimālā Churn Law is one of the foremost Indian scholars of the present generation and his many publications display critical acumen and sound research. In his *Women in Buddhist Literature*, he has broken new ground. He has utilized for his purpose original Pāli literature and the book is thus based on research of a high order. It deals comprehensively with the subjects in its various aspects—marriage, slave girls, dancing girls and courtesans, female character, female education, women and Buddhism, Bhikkhuni Samgha and lastly, prominent Buddhist women. It is thus a valuable contribution to the study of Buddhism in relation to women.

HEAVEN AND HELL IN BUDDHIST PERSPECTIVE

Contents *Heavens as generally described in the Nīlāyās — Illustrative Stories from the Vīmanarāttā Commentary — Observations — Hell*

Dr. Willh Geiger : I appreciate all your works including Heaven and Hell very much, because you collect all the materials contained in the Buddhist and in the Brahmanical literature on some subject, and that is what is chiefly wanted in the present state of our scientific knowledge ' * "

Mr F E Pargiter : ' ' * I have been reading it with much pleasure ' ' "

Prof E. J. Rapson : ' ' ' most useful for reference, and I am glad to be the possessor of a copy

Dr. J Estlin Carpenter : ' ' ' full of rich illustrations of the working of the principles of kamma in merit and guilt. A comparison with similar conceptions in Brahmanism would show how much folklore was common to the two groups of teaching. You have appropriately pointed this out again and again, and it would be very interesting to know how far the views in the Pūranas can be traced to Buddhist teaching, and how far they still held at the present day ' ' "

The Right Hon'ble the Earl of Ronaldshay, P C., G C S.I., G C I.E., etc., etc (Extract from the Foreword) : "In it Dr Law sets before the reader the ideas of Heaven and Hell prevalent amongst the people of Northern India at the time of Buddha and incorporated subsequently in the Buddhist scriptures. It is only in the mind of the non-Indian readers that any confusion between Nirvana and Heaven is likely to arise. And in his case this volume will serve to dispel any confusion that may exist. The Heavens and Hells, of which we read in these

pages, may be said to exist for the purpose of providing a more elaborate stage than this earth can do, for the play of the ever revolving cycle of existence and all that it involves. Dr Law has been at pains to collect from Buddhist literature a number of descriptions both of the pleasures of Heaven and of the sorrows of Hell. If the reader after perusal of the volume has not acquired a comprehensive knowledge of the eschatology of popular Buddhism, he will have no one but himself to blame for Dr Law has admirably accomplished the task which he set out to perform."

The Times Literary Supplement —As Lord Ronaldshay says in the preface, Mr Law has added "yet another volume to the series of interesting studies of Buddhism, upon which he has for some years past been engaged. He deals with the Buddhist conception of Heaven and Hell, which is strongly reminiscent of Dante, to say nothing of the Brahmanical ideas to which apparently it owes its origin. This conception has nothing in common with Buddha's own conception of Nirvana: it is in fact diametrically opposed to it. Whereas Buddha taught that only by renunciation of desire could men be delivered from the bonds which kept them chained to earth, heaven in the literature with which this volume deals offers as its rewards the gratification of the senses. Both heaven and hell are divided into compartments as in the "Divine Comedy", this notion also appears in the Brahmanical literature and there would seem to be some trace of it in St Paul's "third heaven." Only the very virtuous can reach the highest heaven and only the very wicked are cast down to the lowest hell. Rewards are varied and are adapted in kind and degree to the meritorious action, as might be expected from an order which had become sacerdotal, the highest virtue consists of some kind of charity bestowed upon the brethren. The doctrine of rebirths seems to be curiously interwoven with this conception of supernatural worlds, and it is noteworthy that neither Buddhism nor Brahmanism

represents punishment as everlasting. The volume contains much that should be useful to students of comparative religion.

Indian Historical Quarterly, Vol. I., No. 3, September 1925:

Dr B C Law has added another obligation to those which students of India owe him by this careful account of Buddhist ideas of heaven and hell. As in his earlier works, his chief aim has been to present us with a solid mass of definite facts drawn primarily from the original sources, and supplemented by citations of the views of modern scholarship. By limiting the subject-matter treated in each of his works, he is able to give full details from the originals, thus adding at once to the interest of the book and providing the scholar with the background which is almost indispensable for the profitable study of religious belief.

The students of religion will find here abundant illustration of ideas of reward in heaven, and retribution in hell which in India as in the west represents the basic views of the people, monkish ingenuity loses itself in depicting the details of either state and in fashioning precise correspondences of good and evil deeds and their results, but the essential fact remains that for the average Buddhists, as for the average Brahmin, action was dominated by the expectation of bliss and the fear of pain, Nirvana and the absolute were abstractions for the philosophically minded alone to care for. Moreover, it was for the latter alone that "the iron law of karma", to which Lord Ronaldsday in his justly appreciative foreword refers, had absolute validity. In the more human world of popular belief, there is room for the intervention of the Buddha, who conscious of the impending doom of a young student, whose greedy teacher has sent him to bring him a reward of a thousand Kahapanas appears to him and converts him to the faith (p 72), or again Mahamoggallana foreseeing the imminent death of a cowherd presents himself to him in order that he may, by giving to him his own meal of gruel, secure admission into the Tavatimsa heaven (p 80). Sin may be counteracted

by penitence and meritorious deed, and, most important of all, the prayers and actions of others may avail to save their friends from the consequences of their own actions. The latter doctrine is most familiar perhaps from texts other than Pali as in the Chinese story cited by Dr Law (p 104), but the conception is essentially involved in the *Petravattu*.

An interesting supplement to Buddhist views is afforded by citations from the *Markandeya Purana* which displays how much parallelism of idea there is, suggesting a complex process of mutual indebtedness between Buddhist and Brahmin, it might be noted that in numbers of hells the Buddhists have a distinctive penchant for eight and its multiples.

Mahabodhi October 1925 —Belief is still current in the twentieth century, the age of science that Heaven and Hell are abodes actually in existence for receiving the virtuous and the vicious after death. It was in the fifth century B C that this belief of the masses helped the propounder of the New Faith to convert many a man and a woman into Buddhism. Gautama Buddha told many moral tales holding before his audience vivid and living pictures of heavenly bliss enjoyed by the doers of good deeds and also of infernal sufferings undergone by doers of bad deeds. These tales are recorded in the Buddhist literature and show that Nirvana is deserved by one who annihilates *Karma*. Dr Law has succeeded admirably in giving us a fair and lucid idea of Heaven and Hell in Buddhist perspective. He has utilised the *Nikayas*, commentaries and many other books totalling in all forty, and has shown with all clearness and due moderation what the Buddhists understood by Heaven and Hell. Thus he has, to the benefit of the literate and the civilised world, paved the easy way for a critical and comparative work on Heaven and Hell as conceived of by all the faiths of the world. He has, as we find purposely avoided in this work to mention in detail the conception of Heaven and Hell entertained by the people of other religious creeds, and we quite appreciate the author's wisdom in presenting

his readers with a comparison of the Buddhist idea with the Hindu and Christian ideas as far as it was necessary for his purpose. We do not find any appropriate word to conclude this review other than the remarks with which the Earl of Ronaldshay ends his learned foreword to this monograph. The Earl has, with his characteristic administrative ability, done due justice to the author and has rightly said, "If the reader after perusal of the volume has not acquired a comprehensive knowledge of the eschatology of popular Buddhism, he will have no one but himself to blame, for Dr. Law has admirably accomplished the task which he set out to perform."

XVII

THE BUDDHIST CONCEPTION OF SPIRITS (1st Ed)

- Dr Wilhem Geiger** —The Buddhist Conception of Spirits has preserved, no doubt, the popular belief spread all over India. It shows us that Buddhism did not annihilate the older creeds and ideas, but the Teacher adopted them and inserted them into his own system.
- Dr E W Hopkins** — * * * fulfils its purpose admirably in giving a very clear notion of what the Buddhist understood by spirits departed and others. I derived valuable information from the classification on p. 90.
- Dr Rouse** —It is very useful to have the statements of the texts summed up in this way which you seem to have done with admirable clearness.
- Dr J Estlin Carpenter** —Your translations read quite easily in excellent English and you are to be assuredly congratulated on your successful renderings of the stories in the *Paramattha dipani*. * * * excellent work.
- J R A S January 1925** —This little study is a digest of nearly all the traditional "stories of the past" told in the Commentary on the canonical anthology called *Petavatthu*. * * * The digest is preceded and followed up by a brief *omnium gatherum* of *Peta* Iṇa from ancient and modern authorities and a few remarks resuming the main beliefs concerning *Petas* that emerge from the Commentary. * * * There is, as he well points out, in neither verses nor Commentary a vestige of *pitr* worship, or of worship of any kind, there is the one central faith in *karma*, in past action and present result. There is the urgent admonition to secure future weal by present generous giving. * * * an useful addition to the inquirer's shelves.

Bulletin de l'Ecole Francaise d'Extreme Orient, (Tome XXV):

In the two other booklets, the one upon the Buddhist conception of spirits and the other upon Heaven and Hell, Mr Law has reunited the principal texts relating to the life of the other world such as it has been represented in the two small canonical works, *Petavatthu* and *Vimanavatthu*. He has gone into the commentaries of the two texts and reproduced under an abridged form the edifying histories in which it is explained as such or such personage has gone into a celestial palace (*vimana*) or has fallen into the condition of a famished specter or has been condemned in the tortures of the hell. The author has applied himself to clearing up the origin of these Buddhistic beliefs and their agreement with the analogous conceptions found in Brahmanism. He has attempted to compose interesting monographs which are of a nature to facilitate greatly the future researches. We desire that he extends his investigations to other aspects no less important of the doctrine or of the Buddhistic ediology.

THE BUDDHIST CONCEPTION OF SPIRITS

(Revised Edition)

Contents *Pretas and Pitaras — First expression of the Preta belief in Buddhism — Formal Expression of the belief — Physical description of the Pretas — Preta Stories — Doctrinal bearings of the stories*

Dr F W Thomas —It was an original subject for a special memoir and one of interest as wide as humanity. You have made a pleasing book, equipped with good quotations and references and showing well how the Buddhist succeeded in investing this subject also with a congenial aspect of their own piety.

Dr L D Barnett —It is an excellent work illuminating a side of Indian mental life which is really important and yet has been much neglected by previous scholars. I am very pleased to see that the value of your book has been recognised by the public and a second edition called for.

Dr E J Thomas —I must congratulate you on its re-appearance as well as the beautiful aspect of the new edition.

Lord Zetland —May I take this opportunity of congratulating you upon the success of the volume?

J R A S October 1938 —The term 'spirits' is liable to mis-understanding. Even the term 'ghosts' is not exact, for they are not discarnate spirits, but have bodies of a most unpleasant kind. Dr Law defines 'spirits' as a term for 'the unhappy dead who suffer in the nether world on account of their misdeeds in a previous existence'. This does not seem to distinguish those who are suffering in niraya. However, the whole method and treatment of the author makes the matter admirably clear. The work is a valuable exposition of a popular Indian belief as it became modified in the community of Buddhist lay people.

The New Review, September, 1937: In this short but substantial book Dr. B. C. Law tells us all that is known about the Buddhist belief in *pretas*, the spirits or ghosts of the unhappy dead. The origin of the belief, its definition and descriptions, the *pretas* and their state, stories about them, and the moral purpose of these stories—nothing has escaped his scholarship. The result is a volume which no anthropologist, and especially no student of India's popular religion, can afford to neglect.

XVIII

DESIGNATION OF HUMAN TYPES

(*Puggala—Pannatti*)

Dr Wilhelm Geiger —The *Puggalapannatti* is a nice little work which can hardly be overestimated, as it contains a precise definition of many technical terms occurring everywhere in the canonical books. It was a good idea to make it accessible by an accurate and lucid translation. As far as I can judge from those passages which I compared with the original Pali text, this translation is very well made and remarkably correct.

Dr A. Berriedale Keith —I have now found time to study your rendering and I have found it clear, accurate and as attractive as the nature of the subject matter permits. It is most satisfactory to have in so adequate a form the precise content of such a text, as its interest is solely in its substance and your rendering is far more useful to students of Buddhism than the original—and not precisely accurate—text of the P. T. S. edition.

XIX

CONCEPTS OF BUDDHISM

Contents *I Sarana (profession of faith) — II Paramita (perfection) — III Jati (caste) — IV Ariyasaccas (four noble truths) — V Ariya Atthangika-Magga (the noble eightfold path) — VI Jhana (meditation) — VII Puggala (individuality and personality) — VIII Pativcasamuppada (dependent origination) — IX Kammavada (doctrine of Karma) — X Dhamma — XI Nibbana — Index*

From **Lord Zetland's Foreword**: 'But I have said enough, perhaps, to make it clear that scholar and layman alike will find good value in the lucid exposition of these and other concepts of Buddhism which Dr. Law gives us'

Dr. F. W. Thomas: It seems to me to be an excellent work, one of the best of your writings. The precision and exactness of its statements and the aptness of the citations render it eminently suitable for forming and conveying to students a correct idea of the main features of Buddhist doctrine. Lord Zetland's excellent foreword does not say a word too much in praise of your work.

Dr. D. R. Bhandarkar: Like your other works it is replete with erudition, and I have no doubt that it will be very serviceable to scholars.

Dr. W. Stede. Your interesting *Concepts of Buddhism*. This book of yours is valuable to me because it gives such a concise analysis of most difficult terms with a new collection of relevant references from various sources.

Dr. Keith's review in the Indian Historical Quarterly, Vol. XIV, No. 1, 1938: The Kern Institute, Leiden, which has already done much for higher Indian studies has paid a high compliment to Dr. Bimala Churn Law in publishing his monograph on the essential concepts of Buddhism, and the Marquess of

Zetland, whose interest in Indian philosophical thought, is fully attested by his own work, has borne just testimony to the merits of the latest addition to his long series of contributions to our knowledge. Dr Law has once more followed in his regular path, he has aimed at presenting us with a large mass of material, carefully chosen, accurately interpreted, and skilfully co-ordinated, bearing on the essential ideas of Buddhism as it is presented to us especially in the Pali texts. It is not his aim to present a sketch of the original philosophy of the Buddha or of his history but clarify our understanding of the views which became current in the philosophical circles whose discussions and results are presented to us in the Pali Canon. The advantage of the procedure is obvious. The original views of the Buddha are unquestionably beyond our power to determine with any certainty, while we can by careful examination of the texts achieve a very fair appreciation of the views current among his followers or at least one important branch among them.

On this basis Dr Law adheres firmly to the actual assertions of the texts * * *. A careful study of Dr Law's evidence will show that in this form of Buddhism we are far removed from a comprehensive or consistent metaphysic of any kind. As a presentation of Buddhist views as they were, as opposed to a reconstruction of what they can be transformed into by the application of modern categories of thought, Dr Law's work is of permanent value.

The Amrita Bazar Patrika —This treatise, as the title indicates, outlines the doctrine of Buddhism in its principal concepts. The author presents in this small volume a scholarly analysis of the essentials of the doctrine of 'Buddha', 'Dhamma' and 'Nibbana'. His comparative exposition of 'Dhamma', based on textual references is unique, 'Nibbana' is an attainable state equivalent to non-existence—a state in which the individual is wholly unrelated to anything to which in life as we know it, we can apply the term 'object'.

charity, morals, renunciation, wisdom, energy, forbearance, truth, resolution, amity and equanimity. Each perfection is illustrated by one or more stories told in verse, which provide a parallel to the Jataka stories in prose. Many of them are fascinating, all are interesting. But the manner in which renunciation is practised, namely, by passively allowing violence to be done to the helpless, seems to deserve Mrs Rhys David's severe remark that "all manliness has shivelled." Here, also, Dr Law is to be congratulated upon an excellent and elegant translation.

(Reviewed by Professor L F Rushbrook-Williams)

Oriental Literary Digest, 1939, No. 8: The volume under review is No 9 of the Sacred Books of the Buddhists series which was, like the SBE Series, a fond nursling of the pioneer Indologist, Dr F Max Muller and which was later nurtured by Dr Rhys Davids. It is the third part of the 'Minor Anthologies of the Pali Canon,' and comprises an excellent English version of the Buddhavamsa and the Cariyapitaka by Dr Bimala Churn Law, whose love for Indology and scholarship in Buddhist literature needs little or no mention to students of Buddhism.

The Bv and the Cp. are the last two of the fifteen texts of the Khuddaka-Nikaya, the fifth member of the Sutta or the 2nd 'Basket' of the Holy Canon of the Buddhists. The Bv. may be said to comprise four sections *viz* the Dure-Nidana, the Avidure-Nidana, the Santike-Nidana and the Adhigama-Nidana, of which the last would mark the transition from the stage of Bodhisatta to that of Buddhahood. It narrates, in poetical style, legends of the twenty-four Buddhas like Dipankara, Kondanna, Mangala, Sumana etc down to Kassapa, who are the mythical predecessors of Gotama Buddha (chs 2-25). Serving as a preliminary history to his autobiography that comes next (ch 26) from the lips of Gotama Buddha himself, these legends state how each of their heroes set the 'Dhamma-cakka' in motion and how the chief incidents

of Gotama Buddha's life also took place in their lives. Next (ch 27) follows an enumeration of a list of the Buddhas down to Metteya and the last (28th) chapter gives, in all grim solemnity, but at the same time, with a childish elaboration an account of the distribution of the Relics of the Great Holy Prophet.

The *Carīyāpitaka*, a post Asokan work, on the other hand is a cluster of thirty five biographical anecdotes illustrating the various ways of Conduct whereby Gotama Buddha is said to have accomplished the ten Paramitas, *viz* those of Charity, Chastity, Renunciation, Resolution, Truthfulness, Amity, Equanimity, Knowledge, Energy and Forbearance. These Paramitas are the various perfections preparatory to the attainment of Bodhi. The extant text of the Cp, however, illustrates the first seven of these—the first two in ten stories each, and the 3rd, the 4th, the 5th, the 6th and the 7th respectively in 5, 1, 6, 2, and 1 stories. The verses at the end of the book, nevertheless, leave a glaring trace of the existence of the stories about the remaining three Paramitas, and, according to Dr J Charpentier, the extant text of the Cp suffered a remodelling under the influence of the *Atthasālinī*, and, probably, as suggested by Dr M Winternitz, a degeneration owing to it. An attempt at the reconstruction of the original text of the Cp with the help of all possible material, is most welcome, as it is calculated to shed a flood of light on the vicissitudes undergone by this interesting anthology of the Buddhist Canon. We are glad to learn that such a reconstruction has been attempted by Dr B M Barua.*

The Cp can be conveniently regarded as supplementary to the Bv in that, like the latter, the former, too, traces a Bodhisatta's career through the accomplishment of the ten Paramitas to his attainment of the Final Enlightenment. The young age of the book is evinced by its singularly succinct

treatment of the conception of the Paramitas which is a later phase of the development of the cult of the Buddha.

The magnificent volume before us, which is a just compeer of any of the SBB Series, contains in addition to a delicious English translation of the Bv and Cp., explanatory and scholarly footnotes that are replete with references to the commentary and parallelisms from the kindred texts of the Pali Canon such as the Dīgha-Nikaya, the Anguttara-Nikaya, the Majjhima-Nikaya, the Sutta-Nīpata, the Dhammapada and so on. The value of the footnotes is further enhanced by geographical notes on the various places alluded to in the texts. At the end are provided two separate general indices to the important names of persons and places and main topics in each of the books.

In short, this volume is indispensable for the study of the Buddhist Literature and Philosophy, and, Dr Bimala Churn Law deserves sincerest thanks for the goodly help offered by him to students of Buddhism.

Mrs C A F. Rhys Davids, the present editor of the SBB Series, justly expresses her appreciation of the 'customary generosity' of Dr B C Law whose 'gallant offer' enabled her to 'carry on' with the Sacred Books of the Buddhists Series.

R D Laddu

১১ বৌদ্ধ ভ্রমণী-২১০

উদাহ তত্ত্ব—ক্রীতদাসী—নর্তকী ও বাববনিতা—নারী চবিত্র—স্ত্রী শিষ্টা—গৌতম বুদ্ধ ও রমণীগণ—
ব্যতনামা বৌদ্ধ রমণীগণ। ইতিপূর্বে এ বিষয়ে কেহ আলোচনা করেন নাই।

মহামহোপাধ্যায় ডাক্তার শ্রীযুক্ত হবপ্রসাদ শাস্ত্রী বণে।—“বৌদ্ধেরা স্ত্রীলোকদের
কিরূপ সম্মান করিত, কিরূপ লেখাপড়া শিখাইত সমাজে, বিশেষ সমাজে
তাহাদের কিরূপ স্থান দিত তাহাদের স্বভাব-চরিত্র কিরূপ ছিল বৌদ্ধ
হইয়া তাহারা কিরূপে ধর্মোপদেশ দিত, এই সকল কথা খুলিয়া লেখা
আছে।”

২১ সৌন্দর্য্য-কাব্য-১ (দ্বিতীয় সংস্করণ)

নৈতিক চরিত্র গঠনের উৎকৃষ্ট উপাদানে পরিপূর্ণ এই কাব্যখানি অত্যন্ত মনোহর এবং শিক্ষাগ্রন্থ।
ভাষা হৃদয়গ্রাহী ও প্রাঞ্জল।

ভাবতী, গাং, ১৩২৯—এ কাব্যের বঙ্গানুবাদ চেষ্টা এই প্রথম—অনুবাদের ভাষা
স্থানে স্থানে কটমট হইলেও তাহারই ফাঁক দিয়া কবি অশ্বঘোষের কবিত্বের
পরিচয় মাঝে মাঝে বেশ পরিষ্কৃত হইয়াছে।

ভাবতবর্ষ, পৌষ, ১৩২৯—ইহা এতকাল কোন ভাষাতেই অনূদিত হয় নাই,
শ্রীযুক্ত বিমলা বাবুই প্রথম ইহার অনুবাদ করিলেন। বলা বাহুল্য এই
অনুবাদে বাঙ্গালা সাহিত্যের সম্পদ বৃদ্ধি হইয়াছে, এজন্য বিমলা বাবু
আমাদের ধন্যবাদভাজন। অনুবাদে ভাষা অতি সুন্দর হইয়াছে। আমবা
এই পুস্তকখানিও বহুল প্রচার কামনা করি।

মাসী ও নর্মবাণী, ফাল্গুন, ১৩২৯—মূল কাব্যের সৌন্দর্য্য এই পুস্তকখানিতে
অধিকাংশ স্থলেই বজায় আছে।

স্বর্গীয় সাবদাবজ্ঞা বায়—“I have compared a few verses towards the
beginning with your translation The verses are stiff ones
The second one is evidently corrupt In these circumstances,
the translator's work is, by no means, a simple one Yet I
must say that you have acquitted yourself creditably”

শ্রীযুক্ত বাপ্রসাদ চন্দ—“ your excellent translation of the SAUNDARA
NANDA KAVYA of ASWAGHOSA By translating it into Bengali

and publishing it in such a nice manner, you have rendered a valuable service to the Bengali people."

সংস্কৃত সাহিত্য পৰিষৎ পত্রিকা অস্ত্র চ অনুবাদগ্রন্থ সৰ্ব্বতঃ সাবসিক্ষা-
ভাবেপি বহুশ্বেব স্থানেষু মূলগ্রন্থভাবব্যঞ্জকতয়া অং সংস্কৃতভাবপ্রিয়াণাং
বৌদ্ধবৃত্তান্তবেদনসমুৎসুকানাং প্রাচীন কাব্যকলাবীতিমন্ত্ৰবৃত্তভাং পবন
মানু কুণ্যং বিদধ্যাং ।

৩। লিচ্ছবি জাতি ১১০

প্রাচীন ভবন্তেব সভ্যতা, সমৃদ্ধি, আচাৰ্য্যবাহন, ধর্ম, বর্ষ, ভাবের বাবা ইত্যাদি একটি সম্পূর্ণ
প্রতিচ্ছবি ধারণা কবিত্তে হইলে প্রাচীন ভারতের একটি শ্রেষ্ঠ জাতি লিচ্ছবি জাতিব বিনয়ণ পাঠ
করন । জাতীয় জীবন গঠন করিতে হইলে এই প্রাচীন সমস্তাশালী জাতিব ইতিহাস পাঠ করা
একান্ত আবশ্যক ।

৪। গৌতম -বুদ্ধ ১১০ (বুদ্ধদেবেব ধাবাবাহিক সম্পূর্ণ জীবনী ।)

Calcutta Review, June, 1938 : * * * * * There had been indeed a long-felt want in Bengal of a trustworthy biographical narrative of the Buddha, and the few attempts that have hitherto been made to remove this want, have proved rather disappointing. What are needed for the purpose are a critical eye, an historical mind, and an acquaintance with not only the original texts but all up-to-date researches made both in the East and in the West, and Dr Law is a scholar who is well known to have a title to these qualities. His book has naturally resulted in marking distinct improvement upon those by other writers in Bengal. It is not only that the author has collected a vast amount of information, but he has also endeavoured earnestly to eliminate fiction from fact by a careful, comparative and critical study of the materials. His style of writing is, as usual, simple and lucid, and his sources of information are clearly indicated in foot notes * *

Maha-Bodhi, May, 1938 . * * * * * Dr Law has presented in this work all the important facts relating to the life and teachings of the Buddha in a clear and easily intelligible language. A book on Buddhist philosophy is apt to

become abstruse and technical. The great achievement of Dr Law has been to preserve the simplicity of the narration without for a moment departing from accuracy and scientific precision. This book ought to find favour with the reading public in this country for it will tell them all that they want to know about the great Teacher as no other work written in Bengali will do.

আনন্দবাজার পত্রিকা—এই গ্রন্থখানির উল্লেখযোগ্য বিশেষত্ব ইহার অত্যন্ত সরল বাদলা। অথচ বুদ্ধের জীবনের ঘটনা ও বুদ্ধের চরিত্র ইহাতে পূর্ণভাবে আলোচিত হইয়াছে। কোথাও একটি আনুমানিক বা অপ্রামাণিক উক্তি নাই। প্রত্যেকটির সঙ্গে সঙ্গ মূল উল্লিখিত হইয়াছে। ভট্টের বিলাচরণ বৌদ্ধ সাহিত্যে গবেষণার জন্য বিখ্যাত। কিন্তু বর্তমান গ্রন্থে গবেষণা অপেক্ষা সরল ও সংক্ষেপ বর্ণনাই বিশেষ করিয়া সকলকে মুগ্ধ করিবে। এই গুণ গ্রন্থখানি সর্বপ্রাণীর এবং সকল বয়সের লোকের পক্ষে সহজ পাঠ্য হইয়াছে। এহেব শেষাংশে বৌদ্ধ দার্শনিক মত সংগ্রহ দর্শন চর্চাকারীদেরও উপকারে আসিবে।

বিচিত্রা, বৈশাখ, ১৩৪৫—অনেক দিন পরে গৌতম বুদ্ধের জীবনকথা ও ধর্মমত-সম্বলিত একখানি সর্বাঙ্গসুন্দর গ্রন্থ বাঙলায় প্রকাশিত হইল। এই গ্রন্থে ১৯টি পরিচ্ছেদ আছে। ইহাতে গৌতম বুদ্ধের জন্ম, শৈশব ও যৌবন, তাঁহার গৃহত্যাগ, ছন্দক ও কঠকের প্রত্যাবর্তন বুদ্ধত্বলাভ, ধর্মপ্রবর্তন পর্যটন, মহাপরিনির্বাণ প্রভৃতি বুদ্ধের জীবনসংক্রান্ত অবস্থা ভাৱ্য বিষয়গুলি অতি সহজ ও সবল ভাষায় বিবৃত হইয়াছে। বুদ্ধ ও পবিত্রাজক বুদ্ধ ও নিগ্রহ, বুদ্ধ ও সমসাময়িক ধর্মপ্রচারক, বুদ্ধ ও রাজগৃহবর্গ বুদ্ধ ও নাবী প্রভৃতি বিষয়ক পরিচ্ছেদ আলোচনা ও বিবৃতি বিশেষ চিত্তাকর্ষক হইয়াছে। বুদ্ধের ধর্ম ও দর্শন শীর্ষক পরিচ্ছেদে বৌদ্ধদিগের ধর্ম ও দর্শন সবদ্বীয় অবস্থা পঠিতব্য বিষয়গুলি ছোট ছোট ছেলেরাও বুঝিতে পারে এরূপ অতি প্রাঞ্জল ভাষায় লিখিত হইয়াছে। দর্শনের অতি কঠিন বিষয়গুলি এমন হৃদয়গ্রাহি করিয়া গ্রথিত করা হইয়াছে যে পবিত্রায়া সংজ্ঞা প্রভৃতি না জানিয়া সকলে অনাথানে সেগুলির মর্মগ্রহণ করিতে পারে। পরিত্রাজক নিগ্রহ রাজগৃহবর্গ ও সমসাময়িক ধর্মপ্রচারকগণের সহিত বুদ্ধ ব্যাপারঘটিত বিষয়গুলি পড়িলে

মনে হয়, গ্রন্থকাব ইতিহাস ও দৰ্শনেব গভীৰ তত্ত্বমূলক বিষয়গুলি সৰ্বসাধাৰণেব উপযোগী কবিবাব জন্তু বিপুল পৰিশ্ৰম স্বীকাৰ কৰিয়াছেন। কিন্তু বিবৃতিব ভাষা কোথাও কটমট বা আডষ্ট হয় নাই।

বুদ্ধেব জীবেব কাহিনী নানা বৌদ্ধ গ্রন্থে নানা প্ৰকাৰ। বৌদ্ধগ্রন্থনিবন্ধ মতগুলিব মধ্যে কোনটী ঠিক তাহা স্থিৰ কৰিতে বহু আযাস স্বীকাৰ কৰিতে হয়। গ্রন্থকাব বহু বৎসৰ ধৰিয়া বৌদ্ধশাস্ত্ৰ আলোচনা কৰিয়া সাব নিৰ্দ্ধৰ্ষ কবিবাব ব্যপদেশে যে অভিজ্ঞতা অৰ্জন কৰিয়াছেন, তাহাবই ফলস্বৰূপ হইয়াছে বৰ্তমান গ্রন্থে গৌতম বুদ্ধেব জীবেব বিবৃতি।

অল্পমন্ধিৎসু পাঠকেব আলোচনাৰ সুবিধাব জন্তু এই পুস্তকে যে গ্রন্থপঞ্জী (Bibliography) প্ৰদত্ত হইয়াছে, তাহা পাঠকেব বিশেষ উপযোগী কৰিয়া লিপিবদ্ধ হইয়াছে। এই গ্রন্থপঞ্জী অনেকবই উপকাৰে লাগিবে বলিয়া আশা কৰা যায়। গ্রন্থেব প্ৰাৰম্ভে বুদ্ধেব ত্ৰিবৰ্ণেব ছল্লভ চিত্ৰখানি গ্রন্থেব সৌষ্ঠব বৃদ্ধি কৰিয়াছে। আটখানি আৰ্টপেপাৰে মুদ্ৰিত হাফটোন চিত্ৰও এই গ্রন্থে প্ৰদত্ত হইয়াছে। গ্রন্থেব বিবৃতি সবল ও বিশদ হইয়াছে, অথচ বুদ্ধজীবেব সমস্ত প্ৰয়োজনীয় খুঁটিনাটি ইহাব মধ্যে আছে। একপ স্মৃতিস্তিত, স্মলিখিত অনবদ্য-সুন্দৰ গৌতম বুদ্ধেব জীবেব বাঙলা ভাষায় কেন, অত্যাশ্ৰ ভাষায়ও বিবল। প্ৰথম হইতে শেষ পৰ্যন্ত ইহা একপ প্ৰসাদগুণে বিশদীকৃত যে, গ্রন্থখানি পড়িতে আৰম্ভ কৰিলে শেষ না কৰিয়া ওঠা যায় না। গ্রন্থেব ছাপা, কাগজ এবং মলাটও সুন্দৰ। আমবা এই গ্রন্থেব বহুল প্ৰচাৰ কামনা কৰি।

শ্ৰীঅমূল্যচৰণ বিদ্যাভূষণ।

১১ গৌতমবুদ্ধো এ ভূগোল

পালি বৌদ্ধ সাহিত্যে উল্লিখিত গ্ৰাম, দেশ, অবগ্য, পুষ্কৰিণী, হ্ৰদ, নদ, নদী, পৰ্বত, গুহা, চৈত্য, বিহাৰ, প্ৰতীক, সনাত্তকৰণ লিপিবদ্ধ থাকায় সাধাৰণ পাঠকবৰ্গ, গবেষণাকামী ও বিশেষজ্ঞগণেব বহুদিনেব অভাব দূৰীভূত হইয়াছে।

SUPPLEMENTARY OPINIONS & REVIEWS

GEOGRAPHICAL ESSAYS

The Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland April 1939 — This is a collection of articles published in various journals on the ancient geography of India, Burma, and Ceylon, as disclosed by Sanskrit and Pali Buddhist literature, and by the Epics and Puranas. These texts seem to have been widely explored. Other Sanskrit literature remains to be examined in this way while useful geographical data are likely to be found in Chinese works, other than the records of the Buddhist pilgrims, not yet studied for this purpose.

Since the days of the pioneer workers in this line, such as H. H. Wilson, V. de Saint Martin and Alexander Cunningham, a great mass of material has been made available, especially from Buddhist and Jaina literature. The importance of assembling and comparing the information contained in these texts cannot be overestimated and Dr. Law must be thanked for the service he has been rendering in this direction for many years past. It is to be hoped that these researches will lead eventually to the preparation of a much needed work, namely, an atlas of the geography of India in ancient and mediæval times.

In proposing identifications of sites considerable caution is called for, and Dr. Law shows that he is fully alive to this necessity.

(Reviewed by C. E. A. W. Oldham)